

F. S. Cater, Department of Mathematics and Statistics, Portland State University, Portland, Oregon 97207.

## ON INFINITE UNILATERAL DERIVATIVES

## Abstract

We prove that for any continuous real valued function  $f$  on  $[a, b]$  there exists a continuous function  $K$  such that  $K-f$  has bounded variation and  $(K-f)' = 0$  almost everywhere on  $[a, b]$  and such that in any subinterval of  $[a, b]$ ,  $K$  has right derivative  $\infty$  at continuum many points,  $K$  has left derivative  $\infty$  at continuum many points,  $K$  has right derivative  $-\infty$  at continuum many points, and  $K$  has left derivative  $-\infty$  at continuum many points. Furthermore, functions  $K$  with these properties are dense in  $C[a, b]$ . We can assume the infinite derivatives of  $K$  are bilateral if  $f$  is of bounded variation on  $[a, b]$  or if  $f$  satisfies Lusin's condition  $(N)$ .

Let  $[a, b]$  be a compact interval and let  $C[a, b]$  denote the family of continuous real valued functions on  $[a, b]$  endowed with the uniform metric. Here we say that a function is an  $s$ -function if in every subinterval of  $[a, b]$  it has right derivative  $\infty$  at continuum many points, left derivative  $\infty$  at continuum many points, right derivative  $-\infty$  at continuum many points, and left derivative  $-\infty$  at continuum many points.

From the classical work of Stanislaw Saks [1] we infer that the  $s$ -functions form a residual subset of the complete metric space  $C[a, b]$ . Here we give a local companion to this global result as follows. For any  $f$  in  $C[a, b]$  there is an  $s$ -function  $K$  such that  $K-f$  is a singular function of bounded variation, that is  $(K-f)' = 0$  almost everywhere on  $[a, b]$ . The idea is that  $K$  and  $f$  have the same Dini derivatives at almost every point in  $[a, b]$ . Furthermore, the  $s$ -functions  $K$  with this property are dense in  $C[a, b]$ .

We say that a function in  $C[a, b]$  is an  $s_0$ -function if in every subinterval of  $[a, b]$  it has (bilateral) derivative  $\infty$  at continuum many points and derivative  $-\infty$  at continuum many points. We will prove that  $K$  (in the preceding paragraph) can be an  $s_0$ -function for certain kinds of functions  $f$ . This works

---

Key Words: unilateral derivative, bilateral derivative, metric space  
Mathematical Reviews subject classification: 26A24, 26A45  
Received by the editors January 6, 2007  
Communicated by: Bernd Kirchheim

when  $f$  is of bounded variation on  $[a, b]$  or when  $f$  satisfies Luzin's condition  $(N)$ , that is  $f$  maps sets of measure zero to sets of measure zero.

We begin with some needed lemmas. The first concerns the Dini derivatives of  $f$ .

**Lemma 1.** *Let  $f$  be a continuous function on  $[a, b]$ . Then there are an uncountable compact subset  $S$  of  $[a, b]$  and a countable set  $T$  such that  $D_+f(x) > -\infty$  for any  $x \in S \setminus T$ .*

PROOF. We immediately dismiss the case in which  $f$  is nonincreasing on  $(a, b)$ , for if it were then  $f$  would be differentiable on a set of positive measure and on a compact subset  $S$  of positive measure. Then  $T$  could be void.

We assume then that there exist  $a_0$  and  $b_0$  in  $(a, b)$  such that  $a_0 < b_0$  and  $f(a_0) < f(b_0)$ . For each  $y$  satisfying  $f(a_0) < y < f(b_0)$ , let  $k(y)$  be the greatest point in the compact set  $\{t \in (a_0, b_0) : f(t) = y\}$ . Necessarily  $D_+f(k(y)) \geq 0$ . Let  $S_0$  denote the set  $\{k(y) : f(a_0) < y < f(b_0)\}$  and let  $S$  denote the closure of  $S_0$ . We deduce that  $k$  is a strictly increasing function from the interval  $(f(a_0), f(b_0))$  into the interval  $(a_0, b_0)$  and hence  $S_0$  is an uncountable set. It suffices to prove that  $S \setminus S_0$  is a countable set.

Let  $w \in S \setminus S_0$  where  $w \neq a_0$ ,  $w \neq b_0$ , and  $w$  is an accumulation point of  $S_0$  from the left. There is an increasing sequence of points  $(y_n)$  in  $(f(a_0), f(b_0))$  such that  $k(y_n)$  converges to  $w$ . Suppose  $(y_n)$  converges to  $y^*$ . Now  $k(y^*) \neq w$ , so  $k$  has a discontinuity at  $y^*$ . In this way every such point in  $S \setminus S_0$  defines a point of discontinuity of  $k$ . Moreover no two  $w_1$  and  $w_2$  can define the same point of discontinuity of  $k$  because  $k$  is strictly increasing. The monotone function  $k$  has only countably many points of discontinuity, so there are at most countably many points in  $S \setminus S_0$  that are accumulation points of  $S_0$  from the left. The argument for accumulation points from the right is analogous.  $\square$

In the next lemma we construct a nondecreasing singular function enjoying certain desired properties.

**Lemma 2.** *Let  $S$  be an uncountable compact set. Then there is a continuous nondecreasing singular function  $g$  on  $[a, b]$  with total variation 2 such that for any continuous function  $h$  with total variation less than 1, the set  $\{x \in S : (g + h)'(x) = \infty\}$  has the power of the continuum.*

PROOF. Any closed subset of the real line is the union of a countable set with a closed set all of whose points are condensation points of itself. Without loss of generality we assume that every point of  $S$  is a condensation point of  $S$ . Let  $S_1 = \{x \in S : x \text{ is both a left and a right accumulation point of } S\}$ . Routine

arguments show that  $S \setminus S_1$  is a countable set. Thus every point of  $S_1$  is a condensation point of  $S_1$  and a left and right accumulation point of  $S_1$ .

Choose points  $A$  and  $B$  in  $S_1$  with  $A < B$ . We construct by induction a sequence of mutually disjoint compact subintervals of  $(A, B)$  with endpoints in  $S_1$  as follows.

Select  $a_1$  and  $b_1$  in  $S_1 \cap (A, B)$  such that  $b_1 - a_1 > \frac{B-A}{2}$ . Suppose that the intervals  $[a_1, b_1], [a_2, b_2], \dots, [a_n, b_n]$  have been selected. Let  $I_n$  be a component of  $(A, B) \setminus (\cup_{j=1}^n [a_j, b_j])$  of maximal length. Select  $a_{n+1}$  and  $b_{n+1}$  in  $S_1 \cap I_n$  such that  $b_{n+1} - a_{n+1} > \frac{m(I_n)}{2}$ .

Denote  $X_0 = (A, B) \setminus (\cup_j [a_j, b_j])$ . It follows from the construction that  $X_0$  has measure zero. Observe that any point in  $X_0$  is an accumulation point of the countable set  $\{a_j\}_j \cup \{b_j\}_j$  and hence lies in  $S$ . Therefore  $X_0 \subset S$ .

Between any two intervals in the sequence there lie other members of the sequence. Thus we can assign a rational number  $r_n$  to each interval  $[a_n, b_n]$  such that the sequence  $(r_n)$  is dense in  $(0, 2)$ ,  $\inf(r_n) = 0$ ,  $\sup(r_n) = 2$ , and such that  $r_j < r_n$  if and only if  $b_j < a_n$ . Let  $g$  be the real valued function on  $\cup_j [a_j, b_j]$  such that  $g = r_n$  on  $[a_n, b_n]$ . Make  $g = 0$  on  $(-\infty, A)$  and  $g = 2$  on  $(B, \infty)$ . We extend  $g$  to a continuous nondecreasing function on the real line in the natural way with  $\inf g = 0$  and  $\sup g = 2$ . Set  $X = \{x \in X_0 : g'(x) = \infty\}$ . Then  $m(X) = m(X_0) = 0$ . From the work of de la Vallée Poussin (consult for example [2, Theorem (9.1), Chapter IV]) it follows that the set  $g\{x : g \text{ has a finite or infinite derivative at } x\}$  has measure 2. But the set  $\{x : g'(x) > 0\}$  has measure zero and we deduce from [2, Theorem (4.5), Chapter IX] that the set  $g\{x : g \text{ has a finite derivative at } x\}$  has measure zero. Thus it follows that

$$m(g(X)) = 2. \quad (1)$$

Now let  $h$  be a continuous function on  $[a, b]$  with total variation less than 1. It suffices to prove that  $(g + h)'(x) = \infty$  at continuum many  $x \in S$ .

Let  $Y = \{y \in X : \min(D_+(g + h)(y), D_-(g + h)(y)) < \infty\}$ . Intervals of the form  $[g(c), g(c + t)]$  with  $t > 0$  and satisfying

$$g(c + t) - g(c) > 3((g + h)(c + t) - (g + h)(c))$$

form a Vitali covering on the  $y$ -axis of the set  $g(Y)$ . Observe that here

$$-\frac{g(c + t) - g(c)}{3} < -((g + h)(c + t) - (g + h)(c)). \quad (2)$$

Then from (2) we obtain

$$\begin{aligned} -(h(c+t) - h(c)) &= (g(c+t) - g(c)) - ((g+h)(c+t) - (g+h)(c)) \\ &> (g(c+t) - g(c)) - \frac{g(c+t) - g(c)}{3} \\ &= 2 \cdot \frac{g(c+t) - g(c)}{3} \end{aligned}$$

and because  $t$  and  $g(c+t) - g(c)$  are positive it follows that

$$|h(c+t) - h(c)| \geq 2 \cdot \frac{g(c+t) - g(c)}{3}. \quad (3)$$

By the Vitali Covering Theorem there are countably many mutually disjoint such intervals  $[g(c_j), g(c_j + t_j)]$  covering almost every point in  $g(Y)$ . Furthermore the intervals  $[c_j, c_j + t_j]$  are mutually disjoint. From (3) and the total variation of  $h$  we infer that

$$1 \geq \sum_j |h(c_j + t_j) - h(c_j)| \geq 2 \cdot \sum_j \frac{g(c_j + t_j) - g(c_j)}{3} \geq 2 \cdot \frac{m(g(Y))}{3}$$

and

$$m(g(Y)) \leq \frac{3}{2}. \quad (4)$$

From (1) and (4) we obtain

$$m(g(X \setminus Y)) \geq \frac{1}{2}. \quad (5)$$

It follows from (5) that the sets  $g(X \setminus Y)$  and  $X \setminus Y$  have the power of the continuum and because  $X \subset X_0 \subset S$ ,  $\{x \in S : (g+h)'(x) = \infty\}$  has the power of the continuum.  $\square$

In the next lemma we introduce a space  $(BV)$  that has a different metric than the uniform metric.

**Lemma 3.** *Let  $S$  be an uncountable compact set. Let  $(BV)$  denote the family of singular functions of bounded variation on  $[a, b]$  under the metric*

$$d(f, g) = |f(0) - g(0)| + V(f - g),$$

where  $V$  denotes the total variation on  $[a, b]$ . Let

$$W = \{f \in (BV) : f'(x) = \infty \text{ at continuum many points } x \text{ in } S\}.$$

Then  $(BV)$  is a complete metric space and the function 0 is in the closure of the interior of  $W$ .

PROOF. Let  $(BV_1)$  denote the family of all functions of bounded variation on  $[a, b]$  under the same metric that  $(BV)$  has. Then  $(BV) \subset (BV_1)$ . Routine arguments show that  $(BV_1)$  is a complete metric space.

Let  $f_1 \in (BV_1) \setminus (BV)$  and  $f_2 \in (BV)$ . Set  $\epsilon > 0$  such that the set

$$\{x \in [a, b] : \max(|D^+ f_1(x)|, |D_+ f_1(x)|, |D^- f_1(x)|, |D_- f_1(x)|) > \epsilon\}$$

has measure greater than  $\epsilon$ . By a straight-forward application of the Vitali Covering Theorem, there exist mutually disjoint intervals  $[x_1, x_1 + t_1], [x_2, x_2 + t_2], \dots, [x_n, x_n + t_n]$  such that

$$\sum_{i=1}^n |f_1(x_i + t_i) - f_1(x_i)| > \epsilon \cdot \sum_{i=1}^n t_i > \epsilon^2.$$

It follows that  $d(f_1, 0) > \epsilon^2$ . By the same argument  $d(f_1, f_2) = d(f_1 - f_2, 0) > \epsilon^2$  and we deduce that  $(BV)$  is a closed subset of  $(BV_1)$ . But  $(BV_1)$  is a complete metric space, so  $(BV)$  is likewise a complete metric space.

We deduce that the function  $g$  in Lemma 2 lies in the interior of  $W$ , so the distance in  $(BV)$  from the 0 function to  $(\textit{interior } W)$  is at most 2. For any  $r > 0$ ,  $r(\textit{interior } W) \subset \textit{interior } W$ . It follows that the distance from the 0 function to  $(\textit{interior } W)$  is zero.  $\square$

We are now ready for our main results.

**Theorem 1.** *Let  $f$  be a continuous function on  $[a, b]$ . Then there is an  $s$ -function  $K$  such that  $K - f$  is of bounded variation and  $(K - f)' = 0$  almost everywhere. Furthermore, the family of all functions  $K$  satisfying this property is dense in  $C[a, b]$  under the topology of uniform convergence.*

PROOF. Let  $I$  be a subinterval of  $[a, b]$ . For  $g \in C[a, b]$  let

$$A(g) = \{G \in (BV) : (G + g)'_+(x) = \infty \text{ at continuum many } x \in I\}.$$

By Lemma 1 there is an uncountable compact set  $S \subset I$  such that  $D_+ g(x) > -\infty$  on a cocountable subset of  $S$ . We deduce from Lemma 3 that the 0 function is in the closure of the interior of the set  $A(g)$ .

Let  $h$  be any function in  $(BV)$  and let  $g_0 = g + h$ . Let  $G_0 \in A(g_0)$ . Then  $(G_0 + g_0)'_+(x) = \infty$  and likewise  $((G_0 + h) + (g_0 - h))'_+(x) = \infty$  at continuum many points  $x$  in  $I$ . It follows that  $G_0 + h \in A(g_0 - h) = A(g)$  and furthermore  $A(g_0) + h \subset A(g)$ . By Lemma 3 again the 0 function is in the closure of the interior of  $A(g_0)$  and  $h$  is in the closure of the interior of  $A(g_0) + h$ . Thus  $h$  is

in the closure of the interior of  $A(g)$ . The choice of  $h$  is independent of  $g$ , so the interior of  $A(g)$  is dense in  $(BV)$  for any  $g \in C[a, b]$ .

For any subinterval  $I$  of  $[a, b]$ , let  $P(I)$  be the family  $A(f)$  as described. Then  $\cap_I P(I)$ , where  $I$  runs over all the subintervals of  $[a, b]$  with rational endpoints, is a residual subset of the complete metric space  $(BV)$ .

It follows that the family  $P_1$  of functions  $F$  in  $(BV)$  for which  $(F+f)'_r(x) = \infty$  at continuum many points  $x$  in each subinterval of  $[a, b]$  is a residual subset of the complete metric space  $(BV)$ . Let  $P_2$  denote the corresponding family in which we replace  $\infty$  with  $-\infty$ . It follows similarly that  $F_2$  is a residual subset of  $(BV)$ . Let  $P_3$  and  $P_4$  be the corresponding families where left derivatives (instead of right derivatives) are employed. Then  $P_3$  and  $P_4$  are likewise residual subsets of  $(BV)$ . Set  $P = P_1 \cap P_2 \cap P_3 \cap P_4$ . Then  $P$  is a residual subset of  $(BV)$ . But any function in  $P + f$  is an  $s$ -function and hence any function in  $P + f$  suffices for  $K$  in the conclusion of Theorem 1.

Finally  $(BV) + f$  is evidently dense in the space  $C[a, b]$  under the topology of uniform convergence, so  $P + f$  is also dense in  $C[a, b]$ .  $\square$

For certain kinds of functions  $f \in C[a, b]$ ,  $s$ -functions in Theorem 1 can be replaced by  $s_0$ -functions, as we now see.

**Theorem 2.** *Let  $f \in C[a, b]$  such that either*

- (i)  *$f$  is differentiable on a set of positive measure in every subinterval of  $[a, b]$  or*
- (ii)  *$f$  is differentiable at each point of a residual subset of  $[a, b]$ .*

*Then there is an  $s_0$ -function  $K$  on  $[a, b]$  such that  $(K - f)' = 0$  almost everywhere on  $[a, b]$ . Furthermore the family of all  $s_0$ -functions satisfying this property is dense in  $C[a, b]$  under the topology of uniform convergence.*

PROOF. (i) In any subinterval  $I$  of  $[a, b]$   $f$  is differentiable on a set of positive measure that must contain an uncountable compact set. Then Lemma 1 applies to  $f$  and we continue as in the proof of Theorem 1. Observe that all the derivatives are bilateral here.

- (ii) A residual subset of  $[a, b]$  must contain a dense  $G_\delta$ -subset of every subinterval of  $[a, b]$ , which in turn must contain a perfect set. Hence  $f$  is differentiable on an uncountable compact set in every subinterval of  $[a, b]$ . We proceed as in part (i).  $\square$

Some corollaries are immediate.

**Corollary 1.** *The family of all  $s_0$ -functions in  $(BV)$  is a residual subset of  $(BV)$ .*

PROOF. Apply the proof of Theorem 1 to any constant function  $f$ .  $\square$

**Corollary 2.** *For any measurable function  $h$  on  $[a, b]$ , there is a continuous  $s_0$ -function  $F$ , depending on  $h$ , such that  $F' = h$  almost everywhere on  $[a, b]$ .*

PROOF. By [2, Theorem (2.3), Chapter VII, p. 217] there is a function  $F_1 \in C[a, b]$  such that  $F_1' = h$  almost everywhere on  $[a, b]$ . Apply Theorem 2 to  $F_1$ .  $\square$

Observe that any function of bounded variation in  $C[a, b]$  satisfies the hypothesis of Theorem 2. Likewise any  $f \in C[a, b]$  that maps sets of measure zero to sets of measure zero (Lusin's condition  $(N)$ ) must be differentiable on a set of positive measure in each subinterval of  $[a, b]$  (consult [2, Chapter IX, Theorem (7.9), p.286] and so satisfies the hypothesis of Theorem 2.

**Corollary 3.** *There is an  $s$ -function  $F \in C[a, b]$  such that for any measurable function  $k$  on  $[a, b]$  there is a sequence of positive numbers  $(t_n)$  converging to 0, and depending on  $k$ , such that*

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{F(x + t_n) - F(x)}{t_n} = k(x)$$

for almost every  $x$  in  $[a, b]$ .

PROOF. By [2, p. 118] there exists a function  $F_0$  in  $C[a, b]$  satisfying this property. Apply Theorem 1 to  $F_0$ .  $\square$

**Corollary 4.** *Let  $f$  be a positive function in  $C[a, b]$ . Then there exist functions  $F, F_1, F_2$  in  $(BV)$  such that*

- (i)  $F + (\log f)$  is an  $s$ -function,
- (ii)  $F_1 f$  is an  $s$ -function, and
- (iii)  $f^{F_2}$  is an  $s$ -function, provided  $f > 1$  on  $[a, b]$ .

PROOF. (i) The proof of (i) is in the proof of Theorem 1.

(ii) Let  $p \in C[a, b]$  and  $x \in (a, b)$ . By the Mean Value Theorem we see that

$$\frac{\exp(p(x+t)) - \exp(p(x))}{t} = \frac{e^u(p(x+t) - p(x))}{t}$$

for some number  $u$  between  $p(x+t)$  and  $p(x)$ . From this we deduce that  $p$  is an  $s$ -function if and only if  $\exp(p)$  is an  $s$ -function.

Let  $G$  be a function in  $(BV)$  such that  $G + \log f$  is an  $s$ -function. Then  $\exp(G + \log f) = f(\exp G)$  is an  $s$ -function and  $\exp G$  is in  $(BV)$ .

- (iii) Let  $G$  be a function in  $(BV)$  such that  $G(\log f)$  is an  $s$ -function. Then  $\exp(G \log f) = f^G$  is an  $s$ -function and  $G$  is in  $(BV)$ . □

We close with the comment that if  $f_1, f_2, f_3, \dots, f_n, \dots$  is a sequence of functions in  $C[a, b]$  then there is a function  $F$  in  $(BV)$  such that  $F + f_j$  is an  $s$ -function for each index  $j$ . We leave the proof.

## References

- [1] S. Saks, *On the Functions of Besicovich in the Space of Continuous Functions*, *Fund. Math.*, **19** (1932), 211–219.
- [2] S. Saks, *Theory of the Integral*, 2nd. Rev. Ed., Dover, New York, 1964.
- [3] F. S. Cater, *An Elementary Proof of a Theorem on Unilateral Derivatives*, *Canad. Math. Bull.*, **29(3)** (1986), 341–343.