

nacci series  $0, 1, 1, 2, 3, 5, 8, 13, \dots$  giving the values of the Lucas function  $U_n$  associated with the polynomial  $x^2 - x - 1$ . This polynomial is irreducible modulo 13, so that the period of the Fibonacci series modulo 13 gives the period of the mark  $\alpha$  associated with  $x^2 - x - 1$  in the finite field of order  $13^2$ . We have  $\omega = 7$ , norm  $\alpha = -1$ ,  $\theta = 2$ ,  $k = 2$ ,  $\sigma = 2$ ,  $p - 1 = 12$ . Hence (2) becomes  $(2, 2) \mid \delta \mid (2, 12)$ , so that  $\delta = 2$ . Hence the period is 28, which is easily verified directly. It seems quite difficult to determine the exact value of  $\delta$  in all cases.\*

CALIFORNIA INSTITUTE OF TECHNOLOGY

## ON A PROBLEM OF KNASTER AND ZARANKIEWICZ†

BY J. H. ROBERTS

Knaster and Zarankiewicz have proposed the following problem:‡ “Does every continuum  $A$  contain a subcontinuum  $B$  such that  $A - B$  is connected?” Knaster has shown,§ by an example in 3-space, that the answer is in the negative. In the present paper an example is given of a *plane* continuum  $M$  such that every non-degenerate proper subcontinuum of  $M$  disconnects  $M$ .

The point sets considered in this paper all lie in a plane.

DEFINITION OF  $F(C; X, Y; \epsilon)$ . Let  $C$  be any simple closed curve,  $X$  and  $Y$  distinct points of  $C$ , and  $\epsilon$  any positive number. There exists a finite set of points  $A_1, A_2, \dots, A_n$ , ( $n > 2$ ), such that (a)  $A_1 + A_2 + \dots + A_n$  contains  $X + Y$ , (b)  $A_1, A_2, \dots, A_n$  lie on  $C$  in the order  $A_1 A_2 \dots A_n A_1$ , and (c)  $A_i$  and  $A_{i+1}$  (subscripts are to be reduced modulo  $n$ ) are the end points of an arc  $t_i$  of diameter  $< \epsilon$  which is a subset of  $C$  not containing  $A_{i+2}$ . There exists a set of mutually exclusive arc segments  $v_1, v_2, \dots, v_n$  lying within  $C$  such that  $v_i + t_i$  is a simple closed curve  $w_i$  of diameter  $< \epsilon$ . Let  $J$  denote the simple closed curve

\* See the discussion at the close of my paper, Transactions of this Society, vol. 33 (1931), p. 165.

† Presented to the Society, December 1, 1933.

‡ Fundamenta Mathematicae, vol. 8 (1926), Problem 42, p. 376.

§ B. Knaster, *Sur un continu que tout sous-continu divise*, Proceedings of the Polish Mathematical Congress, 1929, p. 59.

$\sum_1^n A_i + v_i$ . There exist  $n$  infinite sequences of simple closed curves  $C_{ij}$ , ( $i=1, 2, \dots, n; j=1, 2, \dots$ ), such that (1)  $C_{ij}$  contains  $A_i$  but otherwise lies within  $J$ , (2) the sequence  $C_{i1}, C_{i2}, C_{i3}, \dots$  has as sequential limit set the arc  $A_i + v_i + A_{i+1}$ , (3)  $C_{ij}$  is of diameter  $< \epsilon$ , (4)  $C_{ij} \cdot C_{ik} = A_i$ , ( $j \neq k$ ), and  $C_{ij} \cdot C_{hk} = 0$ , ( $i \neq h$ ), and (5) no point of  $C_{ij}$  lies within any  $C_{hk}$ . The set  $F(C; X, Y; \epsilon)$  is defined as the sum of all the curves  $C_{ij}$  and the  $n$  curves  $w_i$ :

$$F(C; X, Y; \epsilon) = \sum_{i=1}^n \left[ w_i + \sum_{j=1}^{\infty} C_{ij} \right].$$

DEFINITION OF  $M$ . Let  $E$  be any simple closed curve,  $X$  and  $Y$  any two points of  $E$ . Let  $K_1$  denote a set  $F(E; X, Y; 1)$ . Then  $K_1 = \sum_{i=1}^{\infty} E_{1i}$ , where for each  $i$ ,  $E_{1i}$  is a simple closed curve of diameter  $< 1$ , and the common part of  $E_{1i}$  and the sum of the other curves  $E_{11}, E_{12}, \dots$  either is one point, or is two points. Thus  $E_{1i}$  contains distinct points  $X_{1i}$  and  $Y_{1i}$  such that no other point of  $E_{1i}$  belongs to  $E_{1j}$ , ( $i \neq j$ ). For each  $i$  let  $G_{1i}$  be a set  $F(E_{1i}; X_{1i}, Y_{1i}; 1/2)$  and let  $K_2$  be  $G_{11} + G_{12} + \dots$ .

Suppose  $K_1, K_2, \dots, K_n$ , ( $n > 1$ ), have been defined,  $K_1$  being as defined above and, for each  $i$ , the following properties obtain:

I.  $K_i$  is the sum of a countable set of simple closed curves  $E_{i1}, E_{i2}, \dots$ .

II. Each curve  $E_{ih}$  has, in common with the sum of the other curves  $E_{i1}, E_{i2}, \dots$ , either one point or two points.

III.  $X_{ih}$  and  $Y_{ih}$  are distinct points of  $E_{ih}$  such that no other point of  $E_{ih}$  belongs to the sum of the other curves  $E_{i1}, E_{i2}, \dots$ .

IV. No point is common to the interiors of two curves  $E_{ih}$  and  $E_{ik}$ , ( $h \neq k$ ).

V.  $K_{i+1}$ , ( $i < n$ ), is a subset of the sum of  $K_i$  and the interiors of all the curves  $E_{i1}, E_{i2}, \dots$ .

VI. The subset of  $K_{i+1}$ , ( $i < n$ ), which lies on and within  $E_{ih}$  is a set  $F(E_{ih}; X_{ih}, Y_{ih}; 1/[i+1])$ .

For  $n=2$ , the sets  $K_1$  and  $K_2$  defined above have these properties. For each  $i$ , ( $i \leq n$ ), let  $U_i$  be the set of all points of  $K_i$ , each of which belongs to at least two curves of the set  $E_{i1}, E_{i2}, \dots$ , and let  $D_i$  denote  $K_i$  plus the interiors of all the curves  $E_{i1}, E_{i2}, \dots$ .

For each  $k$  let  $G_{nk}$  be a set  $F(E_{nk}; X_{nk}, Y_{nk}; 1/[n+1])$ , and let  $K_{n+1}$  be  $G_{n1} + G_{n2} + \dots$ . Then it readily follows that the sequence  $K_1, K_2, \dots, K_n, K_{n+1}$  has the properties I–VI above. Hence there is an infinite sequence  $K_1, K_2, \dots$  with properties I–VI,  $K_1$  being a set  $F(E; X, Y; 1)$ . Let  $M$  be  $K_1 + K_2 + \dots$  plus all limit points. This is the same as the common part of  $D_1, D_2, \dots$ .

PROOF THAT  $M - H$  IS NOT CONNECTED. Suppose  $H$  is a non-degenerate proper subcontinuum of  $M$ . Suppose  $M - H$  is connected. Now the components of  $M - U_n$  are of diameter  $< 1/n$ . Hence there exists an  $n$  such that  $H$  contains a point  $P$  of  $U_n$ . It will be shown that if  $H$  contains a point of  $U_n$ , then it contains all of  $U_n$ . In view of this, and the fact that  $U_n$  is a subset of  $U_{n+1}$  and that  $M = (U_1 + U_2 + \dots)$  plus limit points, it follows that  $H = M$ , which is a contradiction.

It remains to show that if  $H$  contains a point  $P$  of  $U_n$ , then it contains all of  $U_n$ . Let  $h$  be such that  $P$  belongs to  $E_{nh}$ . The subset of  $K_{n+1}$  which lies on and within  $E_{nh}$  is a set  $F(E_{nh}; X_{nh}, Y_{nh}; 1/[n+1])$ . The points of  $U_{n+1}$  in this set can be labeled  $B_1, B_2, \dots, B_k$ , so that they lie on  $E_{nh}$  in the order  $B_1 B_2 \dots B_k B_1$ . Now each of the infinity of components of  $K_{n+1} - B_i$  is a subset of a different component of  $M - B_i$ . Hence if  $H$  contains  $B_i$ , and  $M - H$  is connected,  $H$  must contain all save one of these components. But  $B_{i+1}$  is a limit point of the sum of the components of  $K_{n+1} - B_i$ . Hence, if  $H$  contains  $B_i$ , it contains  $B_{i+1}$ . But for some  $i$ ,  $P = B_i$ . Thus  $H$  contains all the points of  $U_{n+1}$  on  $E_{nh}$ , and therefore the one or two points of  $U_n$  on  $E_{nh}$ . Now any two curves  $E_{nh}$  and  $E_{nk}$ , of the set  $E_{n1}, E_{n2}, \dots$ , can be joined by a finite chain  $L_1, L_2, \dots, L_e$  of curves of the set  $E_{n1}, E_{n2}, \dots, L_1$  having a point in common with  $E_{nh}$ ,  $L_i$  having a point in common with  $L_{i+1}$ , ( $i < e$ ), and  $L_e$  having a point in common with  $E_{nk}$ . Since these common points are in  $U_n$ , and  $H$  contains a point of  $U_n$  in  $E_{nh}$ , it readily follows, by repeated application of the above argument, that  $H$  contains every point of  $U_n$  in  $E_{nh} + L_1 + L_2 + \dots + L_e + E_{nk}$ , and therefore  $H$  contains every point of  $U_n$ .