

ON STOPPING RULES AND THE EXPECTED SUPREMUM OF S_n/a_n AND $|S_n|/a_n$ ¹

BY MICHAEL J. KLASS

California Institute of Technology

Let $\{X_n\}$ be a sequence of i.i.d. mean zero random variables. Let $S_n = X_1 + \dots + X_n$. This paper is devoted to determining the conditions whereby $E \sup_{n \geq 1} S_n/a_n < \infty$ and $E \sup_{n \geq 1} |S_n|/a_n < \infty$ for quite general sequences of increasing constants $\{a_n\}$. For the sequences $\{a_n\}$ considered, we find it sufficient to examine whether or not $\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} E(\sum_{k=1}^n X_k/a_k)^+ < \infty$. The existence of optimal extended-valued stopping rules with finite expected reward for sequences $\{S_n/a_n\}$ or $\{|S_n|/a_n\}$ is a by-product of our results.

* This generalizes results of D. L. Burkholder, Burgess Davis, R. F. Gundy, B. J. McCabe and L. A. Shepp, who treat the case $a_n = n$.

Given i.i.d. mean zero random variables X_1, X_2, \dots and a sequence of positive constants a_1, a_2, \dots , one may be interested in identifying the conditions under which an extended-valued stopping rule τ exists such that

$$(1) \quad E \frac{S_\tau^+}{a_\tau} = \sup_{t \in T_\infty} E \frac{S_t^+}{a_t} < \infty$$

or

$$(2) \quad E \frac{|S_\tau|}{a_\tau} = \sup_{t \in T_\infty} E \frac{|S_t|}{a_t} < \infty$$

where T_∞ is the class of randomized extended-valued stopping rules based on $\{X_1, \dots, X_n\}$ and $S_n = X_1 + \dots + X_n$.

Works by D. L. Burkholder [1], B. Davis [4], R. F. Gundy [5], B. J. McCabe and L. A. Shepp [7], provide solutions to such problems for $a_n = n$. Namely, (1) is satisfied iff $E X_1^+ \log^+ X_1 < \infty$ and so (2) is satisfied iff $E |X_1| \log |X_1| < \infty$.

Due to Theorem 4 of D. Siegmund [8] or Theorem 1 of M. Klass [6], for any sequence of returns $V_1, V_2, \dots, V_\infty$ based on random variables X_1, X_2, \dots (i.e., $V_n(\omega) = V_n(X_1(\omega), \dots, X_n(\omega))$ for $\omega \in \Omega$), there exists $\tau \in T_\infty$ such that

$$(3) \quad EV_\tau = \sup_{t \in T_\infty} EV_t < \infty \quad \text{whenever}$$

$$(4) \quad E \sup_{1 \leq n \leq \infty} V_n < \infty \quad \text{and}$$

$$(5) \quad \limsup_{n \rightarrow \infty} V_n \leq V_\infty.$$

For the problems treated, (4) is also necessary to ensure the existence of $\tau \in T_\infty$ satisfying (3); and (4) implies that $\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} V_n = 0$ a.s. Hence we define $V_\infty = 0$

Received May 4, 1973; revised October 20, 1973.

¹ The preparation of this paper was sponsored in part by the U. S. Air Force Research Office under Grant AF-AFOSR-69-1781. Reproduction in whole or in part is permitted for any purpose of the United States Government.

AMS 1970 subject classifications. Primary 60G40; Secondary 60G50.

Key words and phrases. S_n/a_n , stopping rule, supremum, expected value, a.s. convergence.

so that (4) \implies (5). (Note: $V_n = S_n^+/a_n$ or $V_n = |S_n|/a_n$.) Throughout the entire paper we will regard V_∞ as zero, regardless of $\{V_n\}$ or $\limsup_{n \rightarrow \infty} V_n$.

The problem of bounding $E \max_{1 \leq k \leq n} (|S_k|)/a_k$ above can be reduced by means of the proof of Kronecker's lemma to that of upper bounding $E \max_{1 \leq k \leq n} |\sum_{j=1}^k X_j/a_j|$. Thanks to the fact that for independent mean zero random variables Y_1, Y_2, \dots, Y_n ,

$$E \max_{1 \leq k \leq n} (\sum_{j=1}^k Y_j)^+ \leq 8E(\sum_{j=1}^n Y_j)^+,$$

the complexity of the problem at hand is considerably reduced, sufficiently so as to enable the derivation of a solution in a quite general setting.

Our primary results are twofold: Let $a(\cdot)$ be a nonnegative continuous function such that for some $\alpha > \frac{1}{2}$, $a(y)/y^\alpha \nearrow \infty$.

Then

$$(6) \quad E|X_1| \int_1^{a^{-1}|X_1|^{1/\alpha}} (1/a(y)) dy < \infty \quad \text{iff (2) holds.}$$

If, in addition, $\liminf_{y \rightarrow \infty} (a(y)/y) > 0$, then

$$(7) \quad E(X_1^+ \int_1^{a^{-1}X_1^{1/\alpha}} (1/a(y)) dy) < \infty \iff (1).$$

As a result, (2) holds with $a_n = n^{1/\alpha}$ for some $1 < \alpha < 2$ iff $E|X_1|^\alpha < \infty$. Assuming $a_n = (n \log n) \vee 1$, (1) is equivalent to the requirement that $EX_1^+ \log^+(\log X_1) < \infty$. For $a_n = (n \log \log n) \vee 1$, (1) is equivalent to the condition $EX_1^+ \log^+(\log \log X_1) < \infty$, and so forth.

Other results relate to such quantities as $E \sup_{n \geq 1} (X_n/a_n)$ and the a.s. convergence of $\sum_{k=1}^\infty (X_k/a_k)$.

THEOREM 1. *Let Y_1, Y_2, \dots be independent mean zero random variables. Let $T_n = Y_1 + \dots + Y_n$. Then*

$$ET_n^+ \leq E \max_{1 \leq k \leq n} T_k^+ \leq 8ET_n^+.$$

PROOF. The left side is obvious. We first prove what is essentially Ottaviani's inequality (Chung [3] page 114). Fix $u \geq 0$ and $n \geq 1$. Let

$$\begin{aligned} \tau &= \text{1st } k \leq n: T_k \geq 2u && \text{if such } k \text{ exists} \\ &= \infty && \text{otherwise.} \end{aligned}$$

Since

$$\{\tau = k, T_n - T_k \geq -u\} \subseteq \{\tau = k, T_n \geq u\}, \quad \text{therefore}$$

$$\sum_{k=1}^n P\{\tau = k, T_n - T_k \geq -u\} \leq \sum_{k=1}^n P(\tau = k, T_n \geq u) \leq P(T_n \geq u).$$

Also

$$1_{\{\tau=k\}} \text{ and } 1_{\{T_n - T_k \geq -u\}} \text{ are independent.}$$

Hence

$$P(T_n \geq u) \geq \sum_{k=1}^n P(\tau = k)P(T_n - T_k \geq -u)$$

and therefore

$$(8) \quad P(T_n \geq u) \geq \min_{1 \leq k \leq n} P(T_n - T_k \geq -u)P(\max_{1 \leq k \leq n} T_k \geq 2u).$$

$$\begin{aligned} \min_{1 \leq k \leq n} P(T_n - T_k \geq -u) &= 1 - \max_{1 \leq k \leq n} P(T_n - T_k < -u) \\ &= 1 - \max_{1 \leq k \leq n} P(T_k - T_n > u) \\ &\geq 1 - \max_{1 \leq k \leq n} \frac{E(T_k - T_n)^+}{u} \\ &= 1 - \max_{1 \leq k \leq n} \frac{E(T_n - T_k)^+}{u} = 1 - \frac{E(T_n - T_1)^+}{u} \\ &\geq 1 - \frac{ET_n^+}{u}. \end{aligned}$$

Thus $u \geq 2ET_n^+$ implies

$$P(\max_{1 \leq k \leq n} T_k \geq 2u) \leq \frac{P(T_n \geq u)}{1 - ET_n^+/u} \leq 2P(T_n \geq u).$$

Estimating $E \max_{1 \leq k \leq n} T_k^+$, we have

$$\begin{aligned} E \max_{1 \leq k \leq n} T_k^+ &= 2 \int_0^\infty P(\max_{1 \leq k \leq n} T_k^+ \geq 2u) du \\ &\leq 4ET_n^+ + 2 \int_{2ET_n^+}^\infty P(\max_{1 \leq k \leq n} T_k^+ \geq 2u) du \\ &\leq 4ET_n^+ + 4 \int_{2ET_n^+}^\infty P(T_n \geq u) du \\ &\leq 8ET_n^+. \end{aligned}$$

REMARK. Since $ET_n^- = ET_n^+$, any condition on $\{Y_n^+\}$ which is necessary to ensure that $\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} E \max_{1 \leq k \leq n} T_k^+ < \infty$ is a condition on $\{Y_n\}$.

LEMMA 1. Let $\{X_n\}$ be a sequence of independent identically distributed random variables with common distribution function F . Let $a(y)$ be a nonnegative strictly increasing continuous function defined for $y \geq 0$. Write $a_j = a(j)$. Then

$$\begin{aligned} -\frac{1}{a_1} EX_1^+ + \int_{a_1}^\infty (x \int_1^{a^{-1}(x)} (1/a(y)) dy) dF(x) \\ \leq \sum_{n=1}^\infty \int_{a_n}^\infty \frac{x dF(x)}{a_n} \leq \frac{1}{a_1} EX_1^+ + \int_{a_1}^\infty (x \int_1^{a^{-1}(x)} (1/a(y)) dy) dF(x). \end{aligned}$$

PROOF. Let $A_j = \{a_j < x \leq a_{j+1}\}$.

$$\begin{aligned} \sum_{n=1}^\infty \int_{a_n}^\infty \frac{x dF(x)}{a_n} &= \sum_{n=1}^\infty \sum_{j=n}^\infty \int_{A_j} \frac{x dF(x)}{a_n} \\ &= \sum_{j=1}^\infty \int_0^\infty \left(\sum_{n=1}^j \frac{1}{a_n} \right) x 1_{A_j} dF(x). \end{aligned}$$

The right-hand inequality is easy because

$$\sum_{n=1}^j \frac{1}{a_n} 1_{A_j} \leq \frac{1}{a_1} + \int_1^{a^{-1}(x)} (1/a(y)) dy 1_{A_j}.$$

As for the left-hand side,

$$\begin{aligned} \left(\sum_{n=1}^j \frac{1}{a_n} \right) 1_{A_j} &\geq \left(\int_1^j \frac{1}{a(y)} dy \right) 1_{A_j} \\ &= \left(\int_1^{a^{-1}(x)} (1/a(y)) dy \right) 1_{A_j} - \left(\int_j^{a^{-1}(x)} (1/a(y)) dy \right) 1_{A_j} \\ &\geq \left(\int_1^{a^{-1}(x)} (1/a(y)) dy - \frac{1}{a_j} \right) 1_{A_j} \\ &\geq \left(\int_1^{a^{-1}(x)} (1/a(y)) dy - \frac{1}{a_1} \right) 1_{A_j}. \end{aligned}$$

COROLLARY 1. *With $\{X_n\}$ and $a(y)$ as above,*

$$\begin{aligned} -\frac{E|X_1|}{a_1} + \int_{\{|x|>a_1\}} (|x| \int_1^{a^{-1}(|x|)} (1/a(y)) dy) dF(x) \\ \leq \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \int_{\{|x|>a_n\}} \frac{|x| dF(x)}{a_n} \leq \frac{E|X_1|}{a_1} + \int_{\{|x|>a_1\}} (|x| \int_1^{a^{-1}(|x|)} (1/a(y)) dy) dF(x). \end{aligned}$$

LEMMA 2. *Let $\{X_n\}$ be a sequence of i.i.d. mean zero random variables. Let $\{a_n\}$ be a sequence of positive numbers such that for some $\varepsilon > 0$, $a_n/n^\varepsilon \nearrow$. Then for each $M > 0$, $P(X_n \geq a_n \text{ i.o.}) = P(X_n \geq Ma_n \text{ i.o.})$.*

PROOF. Suppose $N^{1/\varepsilon}$ is a positive integer. If $P(X_n \geq a_n \text{ i.o.}) = 1$, then

$$\begin{aligned} \infty &= \sum_{n=N^{1/\varepsilon}}^{\infty} P(X_n \geq a_n) \\ &= \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \sum_{k=0}^{N^{1/\varepsilon}-1} P(X_1 \geq a(nN^{1/\varepsilon} + k)) \\ &\leq N^{1/\varepsilon} \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} P(X_1 \geq a(nN^{1/\varepsilon})) \\ &\leq N^{1/\varepsilon} \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} P(X_1 \geq Na_n), \end{aligned}$$

so that $P(X_n \geq Na_n \text{ i.o.}) = 1$.

For any $M \geq 1 \exists N \geq M$ such that $N^{1/\varepsilon}$ is a positive integer. Now

$$\begin{aligned} P(X_n \geq a_n \text{ i.o.}) &\geq P(X_n \geq Ma_n \text{ i.o.}) \\ &\geq P(X_n \geq Na_n \text{ i.o.}). \end{aligned}$$

The extreme terms are equal regardless of whether $P(X_n \geq a_n \text{ i.o.})$ is zero or one. Hence

$$P(X_n \geq a_n \text{ i.o.}) = P(X_n \geq Ma_n \text{ i.o.}).$$

The case in which $0 < M < 1$ can be reduced to the previous situation by letting $b(y) = Ma(y)$ and observing that $b(y)/y^\varepsilon \nearrow$ so that $P(X_n \geq b(n)) \text{ i.o.} = P(X_n \geq M^{-1}b(n) \text{ i.o.})$.

THEOREM 2. *Let $\{X_n\}$ be a sequence of i.i.d. mean zero random variables with common distribution function F . Let $a(y)$ be a nonnegative continuous function defined for $y \geq 0$. Suppose*

$$(9) \quad \text{for some } \varepsilon > 0, \quad \frac{a(y)}{y^\varepsilon} \nearrow \infty$$

$$(10) \quad \int_{a_1}^{\infty} x \int_1^{a^{-1}(x)} (1/a(y)) dy dF(x) = \infty.$$

Then $\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} E(\sum_{k=1}^n (X_k)/a_k)^+ = \infty$, $E \sup_{n \geq 1} (S_n^+)/a_n = \infty$, and $E \sup_{n \geq 1} (X_n^+)/a_n = \infty$. (Note that $S_n = X_1 + \dots + X_n$.)

PROOF. Assume that $P(X_n \geq a_n \text{ i.o.}) = 1$. Fix M large. For each $n \geq 1$, let

$$t_n = \begin{cases} \text{last } k \leq n: X_k \geq Ma_k & \text{if such } k \text{ exists} \\ \infty & \text{otherwise.} \end{cases}$$

Observe that $P(t_n \neq \infty) = P(\bigcup_{k=1}^n \{X_k \geq Ma_k\}) \rightarrow 1$ as $n \rightarrow \infty$ by Lemma 2. From Theorem 1,

$$\begin{aligned} E\left(\sum_{k=1}^n \frac{X_k}{a_k}\right)^+ &\geq \frac{1}{8} E \max_{1 \leq j \leq n} \left(\sum_{k=1}^j \frac{X_k}{a_k}\right)^+ \\ &\geq \frac{1}{8} \sum_{l=1}^n E \max_{1 \leq j \leq n} \left(\sum_{k=1}^j \frac{X_k}{a_k}\right)^+ 1_{\{t_n=l\}} \\ &\geq \frac{1}{8} \sum_{l=1}^n E \left(\sum_{k=1}^l \frac{X_k}{a_k}\right) 1_{\{t_n=l\}} \end{aligned}$$

$\{t_n = l\} \subseteq B(X_l, X_{l+1}, \dots, X_n)$. Hence for $k < l$, $(X_k)/a_k$ and $1_{\{t_n=l\}}$ are independent. Therefore

$$E\left(\sum_{k=1}^n \frac{X_k}{a_k}\right)^+ \geq \frac{1}{8} \sum_{l=1}^n \frac{EX_l 1_{\{t_n=l\}}}{a_l}.$$

Clearly,

$$E \sup_{k \leq n} \frac{X_k^+}{a_k} \geq \sum_{l=1}^n \frac{EX_l 1_{\{t_n=l\}}}{a_l}.$$

Similarly,

$$E \max_{1 \leq k \leq n} \frac{S_k^+}{a_k} \geq \sum_{l=1}^n E \frac{S_l 1_{\{t_n=l\}}}{a_l} = \sum_{l=1}^n \frac{EX_l 1_{\{t_n=l\}}}{a_l}.$$

The three quantities of interest are each bounded below by

$$\frac{1}{8} \sum_{l=1}^n \frac{EX_l 1_{\{t_n=l\}}}{a_l} \geq \frac{1}{8} \sum_{l=1}^n EM 1_{\{t_n=l\}} = \frac{MP(t_n \neq \infty)}{8} \rightarrow \frac{M}{8} \quad \text{as } n \rightarrow \infty,$$

which completes the proof when $P(X_n \geq a_n \text{ i.o.}) = 1$. Now assume $P(X_n \geq a_n \text{ i.o.}) = 0$. For each $n \geq 1$, let

$$t_n = \begin{cases} \text{last } k \leq n: X_k \geq a_k & \text{if such } k \text{ exists} \\ \infty & \text{otherwise.} \end{cases}$$

$$\begin{aligned} P(t_n = \infty) &\geq P(\bigcap_{k=1}^{\infty} \{X_k < a_k\}) \\ &= \prod_{k=1}^{\infty} P(X_k < a_k) = \prod_{k=1}^{\infty} (1 - P(X_1 \geq a_k)) > 0 \end{aligned}$$

since $\sum_{k=1}^{\infty} P(X_1 \geq a_k) < \infty$ and $P(X_1 \geq a_1) < 1$. Let $c = \frac{1}{8} \prod_{k=1}^{\infty} P(X_1 < a_k)$. Again we obtain

$$\begin{aligned} \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \min & \left(E \left(\sum_{k=1}^n \frac{X_k}{a_k} \right)^+, E \max_{1 \leq k \leq n} \frac{S_k^+}{a_k}, E \max_{1 \leq k \leq n} \frac{X_k^+}{a_k} \right) \\ & \geq \frac{1}{8} \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \sum_{k=1}^n \frac{EX_k 1_{\{t_n=k\}}}{a_k} \\ & = \frac{1}{8} \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \sum_{k=1}^n \frac{\left(\int_{a_k}^{\infty} x dF(x) \right)}{a_k} \left(\prod_{j=k+1}^n P(X_j < a_j) \right) \\ & \geq c \sum_{k=1}^{\infty} \frac{\int_{a_k}^{\infty} x dF(x)}{a_k} \end{aligned}$$

which by Lemma 1 is at least

$$c \left(-\frac{EX_1^+}{a_1} + \int_{a_1}^{\infty} (x \int_1^{a^{-1}(x)} (1 - a(y)) dy) dF(x) \right)$$

and is consequently infinite.

LEMMA 3. Let $\{X_n\}$ be a sequence of i.i.d. random variables with common distribution function F . Let $a(y)$ be a strictly increasing continuous function defined for $y \geq 0$. Assume $a(0) = 0$ and $a(\infty) = \infty$. Set $Y_n = X_n 1_{\{0 \leq X_n \leq a_n\}}$. Then

$$\begin{aligned} -P(X_1 > 0) + \int_0^{\infty} \left(x^2 \int_{a^{-1}(x)}^{\infty} \frac{1}{a^2(y)} dy \right) dF(x) \\ \leq \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{EY_n^2}{a_n^2} \leq P(X_1 > 0) + \int_0^{\infty} \left(x^2 \int_{a^{-1}(x)}^{\infty} \frac{1}{a^2(y)} dy \right) dF(x). \end{aligned}$$

PROOF. Let $A_j = \{a_{j-1} < x \leq a_j\}$ for $j \geq 1$.

$$\begin{aligned} \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{EY_n^2}{a_n^2} & = \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \sum_{j=1}^n \int_0^{\infty} \frac{x^2 1_{A_j} dF(x)}{a_n^2} \\ & = \sum_{j=1}^{\infty} \int_0^{\infty} x^2 \left(\sum_{n=j}^{\infty} \frac{1}{a_n^2} \right) 1_{A_j} dF(x). \end{aligned}$$

We deduce the inequality on the right by noting that

$$\begin{aligned} x^2 \left(\sum_{n=j}^{\infty} \frac{1}{a_n^2} \right) 1_{A_j} & \leq x^2 \left(\frac{1}{a_j^2} + \int_{a^{-1}(x)}^{\infty} \frac{1}{a^2(y)} dy \right) 1_{A_j} \\ & \leq \left(1 + x^2 \int_{a^{-1}(x)}^{\infty} \frac{1}{a^2(y)} dy \right) 1_{A_j}. \end{aligned}$$

To produce the left side:

$$\begin{aligned} x^2 \left(\sum_{n=j}^{\infty} \frac{1}{a_n^2} \right) 1_{A_j} & \geq x^2 \left(\int_j^{\infty} \frac{1}{a^2(y)} dy \right) 1_{A_j} \\ & = x^2 \left(\int_{a^{-1}(x)}^{\infty} \frac{1}{a^2(y)} dy - \int_{a^{-1}(x)}^j \frac{1}{a^2(y)} dy \right) 1_{A_j} \\ & \geq x^2 \left(\int_{a^{-1}(x)}^{\infty} \frac{1}{a^2(y)} dy - \frac{j - a^{-1}(x)}{x^2} \right) 1_{A_j} \\ & \geq x^2 \left(\int_{a^{-1}(x)}^{\infty} \frac{1}{a^2(y)} dy - 1 \right) 1_{A_j}. \end{aligned}$$

LEMMA 4.

$$\int_0^\infty \left(x^2 \int_{a^{-1}(x)}^\infty \frac{1}{a^2(y)} dy \right) dF(x) \leq \int_{a_1}^\infty \left(x^2 \int_{a^{-1}(x)}^\infty \frac{1}{a^2(y)} dy \right) dF(x) + P(X_1 > 0) + a_1^2 \int_1^\infty \frac{1}{a^2(y)} dy.$$

PROOF. This follows from the fact that

$$\begin{aligned} \int_{a_1}^\infty \left(x^2 \int_{a^{-1}(x)}^\infty \frac{1}{a^2(y)} dy \right) dF(x) &= \int_{a_1}^\infty x^2 \int_{a^{-1}(x)}^1 \frac{1}{a^2(y)} dy + \int_{a_1}^\infty \left(x^2 \int_1^\infty \frac{1}{a^2(y)} dy \right) dF(x) \\ &\leq \int_{a_1}^\infty (1 - a^{-1}(x)) dF(x) + a_1^2 \left(\int_1^\infty \frac{1}{a^2(y)} dy \right) \\ &\leq P(X_1 > 0) + a_1^2 \int_1^\infty \frac{1}{a^2(y)} dy. \end{aligned}$$

COROLLARY 2. Let $\{X_n\}$ be a sequence of i.i.d. random variables with common distribution function F . Let $a(y)$ be a strictly increasing continuous function defined for $y \geq 0$. Assume $a(0) = 0$ and $a(\infty) = \infty$.

Let $Y_n = X_n 1_{\{|X_n| \leq a_n\}}$. Then

$$\begin{aligned} -1 + \int_{-\infty}^\infty \left(x^2 \int_{a^{-1}(|x|)}^\infty \frac{1}{a^2(y)} dy \right) dF(x) &\leq \sum_{n=1}^\infty \frac{EY_n^2}{a_n^2} \leq 1 + \int_{-\infty}^\infty \left(x^2 \int_{a^{-1}(|x|)}^\infty \frac{1}{a^2(y)} dy \right) dF(x) \\ &\leq 2 + a_1^2 \int_1^\infty \frac{1}{a^2(y)} dy + \int_{\{a_1 \leq |x|\}} \left(x^2 \int_{a^{-1}(|x|)}^\infty \frac{1}{a^2(y)} dy \right) dF(x). \end{aligned}$$

THEOREM 3. Let $\{X_n\}$ be a sequence of i.i.d. non-degenerate mean zero random variables with common distribution function F . Let $a(\cdot)$ be a nonnegative continuous function defined for $y \geq 0$ such that for some $\epsilon > 0$, $a(y)/y^\epsilon \nearrow \infty$. Then the following are equivalent:

(11)
$$\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} E \left| \sum_{k=1}^n \frac{X_k}{a_k} \right| < \infty$$

(12)
$$\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} E \max_{k \leq n} \left| \sum_{j=1}^k \frac{X_j}{a_j} \right| < \infty$$

(13) (i)
$$\int_{\{|x| \geq a_1\}} (|x| \int_1^{a^{-1}(|x|)} (1/a(y)) dy) dF(x) < \infty$$
 and

(ii)
$$\int_{-\infty}^\infty \left(x^2 \int_{a^{-1}(|x|)}^\infty \frac{1}{a^2(y)} dy \right) dF(x) < \infty.$$

REMARK. (ii) may be replaced by the two conditions

$$\int_1^\infty \frac{1}{a^2(y)} dy < \infty$$

and

$$\int_{\{|x| \geq a_1\}} \left(x^2 \int_{a^{-1}(|x|)}^{\infty} \frac{1}{a^2(y)} dy \right) dF(x) < \infty .$$

PROOF. According to Theorem 1, (11) \Rightarrow (12). We next establish that (12) \Rightarrow (13).

By the contrapositive of Theorem 2 applied to $E(\sum_{k=1}^n (X_k)/a_k)^+$ and $E(\sum_{k=1}^n (X_k)/a_k)^-$, (12) \Rightarrow (13) (i). When (12) holds we may invoke the Martingale Convergence Theorem to conclude that $\sum_{k=1}^{\infty} (X_k)/a_k$ converges a.s. Let $Y_n = X_n 1_{\{|X_n| \leq a_n\}}$ and $Z_n = X_n - Y_n$. By the Three Series Theorem (Chung [3] page 112),

$$\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{EY_n^2 - (EY_n)^2}{a_n^2} < \infty .$$

Since

$$\frac{|EY_n|}{a_n} \leq 1, \quad \left(\frac{EY_n}{a_n} \right)^2 \leq \frac{|EY_n|}{a_n} = \frac{|EZ_n|}{a_n}$$

and so

$$\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \left(\frac{EY_n}{a_n} \right)^2 \leq \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{E|Z_n|}{a_n}$$

which, by Corollary 1 is

$$\leq \frac{E|X_1|}{a_1} + \int_{\{|x| > a_1\}} (|x| \int_1^{a^{-1}(|x|)} (1/a(y)) dy) dF(x) < \infty$$

by (13)(i) and the fact that X_1 has finite mean. Thus

$$\infty > \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{EY_n^2}{a_n^2} \geq -1 + \int_{-\infty}^{\infty} \left(x^2 \int_{a^{-1}(|x|)}^{\infty} \frac{1}{a^2(y)} dy \right) dF(x)$$

(see Corollary 2). Hence (12) also implies (13) (ii).

We next assert that (13) \Rightarrow (11).

$$\begin{aligned} E \left| \sum_{k=1}^n \frac{X_k}{a_k} \right| &= E \left| \sum_{k=1}^n \frac{Y_k + Z_k}{a_k} \right| \leq E \left| \sum_{k=1}^n \frac{Y_k}{a_k} \right| + E \sum_{k=1}^n \frac{|Z_k|}{a_k} \\ &\leq \left(E \left(\sum_{k=1}^n \frac{Y_k}{a_k} \right)^2 \right)^{\frac{1}{2}} + \sum_{k=1}^{\infty} \frac{E|Z_k|}{a_k} \\ &= \left(\text{Var} \left(\sum_{k=1}^n \frac{Y_k}{a_k} \right) + \left(E \sum_{k=1}^n \frac{Y_k}{a_k} \right)^2 \right)^{\frac{1}{2}} + \sum_{k=1}^{\infty} \frac{E|Z_k|}{a_k} \\ &\leq \left(\sum_{k=1}^{\infty} \frac{EY_k^2}{a_k^2} + \left(\sum_{k=1}^{\infty} \frac{E|Z_k|}{a_k} \right)^2 \right)^{\frac{1}{2}} + \sum_{k=1}^{\infty} \frac{E|Z_k|}{a_k} . \end{aligned}$$

As has been previously shown, (13)(i) implies

$$\sum_{k=1}^{\infty} \frac{E|Z_k|}{a_k} < \infty \tag{Corollary 1}$$

and (13)(ii) implies

$$\sum_{k=1}^{\infty} \frac{EY_k^2}{a_k^2} < \infty \tag{Corollary 2} .$$

Consequently

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} E \left| \sum_{k=1}^n \frac{X_k}{a_k} \right| < \infty .$$

It is of interest and importance to know when (ii) implies (i) and vice versa. Lemmas 5 and 6 deal with this subject.

LEMMA 5. *Let $a(y)$ be a nonnegative strictly increasing continuous function defined for $y \geq 0$ such that for some $\frac{1}{2} < \alpha < 1$, $a(y)/y^\alpha \searrow$. Then*

$$|x| \int_1^{a^{-1}(|x|)} (1/a(y)) dy \leq \frac{a^{-1}(|x|)}{1-\alpha} \leq \left(\frac{2\alpha-1}{1-\alpha} \right) x^2 \int_{a^{-1}(|x|)}^\infty \frac{1}{a^2(y)} dy .$$

PROOF.

$$\begin{aligned} |x| \int_1^{a^{-1}(|x|)} (1/a(y)) dy &= |x| \int_1^{a^{-1}(|x|)} (y^\alpha/a(y))(1/y^\alpha) dy \\ &\leq |x| \frac{[a^{-1}(|x|)]^\alpha}{|x|} \int_1^{a^{-1}(|x|)} (1/y^\alpha) dy \\ &\leq [a^{-1}(|x|)]^\alpha \frac{[a^{-1}(|x|)]^{1-\alpha}}{1-\alpha} = \frac{[a^{-1}(|x|)]}{1-\alpha} \\ x^2 \int_{a^{-1}(|x|)}^\infty \frac{1}{a^2(y)} dy &= x^2 \int_{a^{-1}(|x|)}^\infty \left(\frac{y^{2\alpha}}{a^2(y)} \right) \left(\frac{1}{y^{2\alpha}} \right) dy \\ &\geq x^2 \frac{[a^{-1}(|x|)]^{2\alpha}}{x^2} \int_{a^{-1}(|x|)}^\infty \frac{1}{y^{2\alpha}} dy \\ &= [a^{-1}(|x|)]^{2\alpha} \frac{[a^{-1}(|x|)]^{1-2\alpha}}{2\alpha-1} = \frac{a^{-1}(|x|)}{2\alpha-1} , \end{aligned}$$

which proves the lemma.

THEOREM 4. *Let $\{X_n\}$ and a be as in Theorem 3. Assume further that for some $\frac{1}{2} < \alpha < 1$, $a(y)/y^\alpha \searrow$. Then (11), (12), and (13) (ii) are also each equivalent to*

$$(14) \quad \sum_{k=1}^\infty \frac{X_k}{a_k} \text{ converges a.s.}$$

PROOF. From the proof of Theorem 3, (12) \Rightarrow (14) and (14) \Rightarrow

$$\sum_{n=1}^\infty \frac{EY_n^2 - (EY_n)^2}{a_n^2} < \infty$$

where $Y_n = X_n 1_{\{|X_n| \leq a_n\}}$. The proof of Theorem 3 also gives

$$\begin{aligned} \sum_{n=1}^\infty \left(\frac{EY_n}{a_n} \right)^2 &\leq \frac{E|X_1|}{a_1} + \int_{\{|x| > a_1\}} |x| \int_1^{a^{-1}(|x|)} (1/a(y)) dy dF(x) \\ &\leq \frac{E|X_1|}{a_1} + \int_{\{|x| > a_1\}} \frac{a^{-1}(|x|)}{1-\alpha} dF(x) \quad (\text{by Lemma 5}) \\ &< \infty \Leftrightarrow \sum_{n=1}^\infty P(a^{-1}(|X_n|) > n) < \infty \\ &\Leftrightarrow \sum_{n=1}^\infty P(|X_n| \geq a_n) < \infty \Leftrightarrow \sum_{n=1}^\infty P(X_n \neq Y_n) < \infty . \end{aligned}$$

Referring once again to the Three Series Theorem, $\sum_{k=1}^{\infty} (X_k)/a_k$ converges a.s. $\Rightarrow \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} P(X_n \neq Y_n) < \infty$. Hence $\infty > \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} (EY_n^2)/a_n^2$ and so (13)(ii) holds (see Corollary 2). By virtue of Lemma 5, (13)(ii) \Rightarrow (13)(i). Therefore (14) \Rightarrow (13) \Rightarrow (12). Consequently, (11), (12), (13)(ii) and (14) are equivalent.

An example will illustrate that if $a(y)/y^\alpha$ is not decreasing for some $\alpha < 1$ then (14) may not imply (11), (12) or (13).

EXAMPLE 1. Let $\{X_n\}$ be a sequence of i.i.d. symmetric random variables with mean zero and common distribution function F . Assume $E|X_1| \log^+ |X_1| = \infty$. Let $a(y) = y$ and $Y_n = X_n 1_{\{|X_n| \leq n\}}$. $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} (X_n)/n$ converges a.s. iff

- (a) $\sum_n P(X_n \neq Y_n) < \infty$,
- (b) $|\sum_n E(Y_n)/n| < \infty$, and
- (c) $\sum_n (EY_n^2 - (EY_n)^2)/n^2 < \infty$ (Three Series Term)

$$E|X_1| < \infty \quad \text{so} \quad \sum_n P(|X_n| > n) < \infty .$$

Thus (a) holds. $EY_n = 0$ so (b) holds.

$$\begin{aligned} \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \int_{\{|x| \leq n\}} \frac{x^2 dF(x)}{n^2} &\leq 1 + \int_{-\infty}^{\infty} \left(x^2 \int_{|x|}^{\infty} \frac{1}{y^2} dy \right) dF(x) && \text{(by Lemma 3)} \\ &= 1 + \int_{-\infty}^{\infty} |x| dF(x) < \infty . \end{aligned}$$

So (c) holds and hence $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} (X_n)/n$ converges. However,

$$\begin{aligned} \int_1^{\infty} |x| \int_1^{|x|} \frac{1}{y} dy dF(x) &= \int_1^{\infty} |x| \log |x| dF(x) \\ &= E|X_1| \log^+ |X_1| = \infty \end{aligned}$$

so that (13)(i) fails to hold.

Whenever $\sum_{k=1}^{\infty} (X_k)/a_k$ converges, Kronecker's lemma can be utilized to give $(S_n)/a_n \rightarrow 0$ a.s. What follows is another condition sufficient to guarantee that $S_n/a_n \rightarrow 0$ a.s. This will be useful when attempting to establish the existence of optimal extended-valued stopping rules.

THEOREM 5. Let $\{X_n\}$ be a sequence of i.i.d. mean zero random variables. Let $a(y)$ be a nonnegative strictly increasing continuous function defined for $y \geq 0$ such that $a(y)/y \searrow$. Let $S_n = X_1 + \dots + X_n$. Assume

$$\int_{-\infty}^{\infty} \left(x^2 \int_{a^{-1}(|x|)}^{\infty} \frac{1}{a^2(y)} dy \right) dF(x) < \infty .$$

Then $S_n/a_n \rightarrow 0$ a.s.

PROOF. Let $Y_n = X_n 1_{\{|X_n| \leq a_n\}}$. We claim that $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} (Y_n - EY_n)/a_n$ converges a.s.

$$\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{\sigma^2(Y_n)}{a_n^2} \leq \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{EY_n^2}{a_n^2} < \infty \quad \text{(Corollary 2).}$$

$((Y_n - EY_n)/a_n)$ is bounded and each term has mean zero. Applying the Three

Series Theorem, $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} (Y_n - EY_n)/a_n$ converges a.s. By Kronecker's lemma,

$$\frac{1}{a_n} \sum_{k=1}^n (Y_k - EY_k) \rightarrow 0 \quad \text{a.s.}$$

Referring to the proof of Lemma 5,

$$x^2 \int_{a^{-1}(|x|)}^{\infty} \frac{1}{a^2(y)} dy \geq \frac{a^{-1}(|x|)}{2\alpha - 1}.$$

Therefore $Ea^{-1}(|X_1|) < \infty$ implies $P(|X_n| > a_n \text{ i.o.}) = 0 \Rightarrow P(X_n \neq Y_n \text{ i.o.}) = 0$ and therefore

$$\sum_{k=1}^n \frac{X_k - EY_k}{a_n} \rightarrow 0 \quad \text{a.s.}$$

$$\begin{aligned} \left| \sum_{k=1}^n \frac{EY_k}{a_n} \right| &\leq \sum_{k=1}^n \int_{\{|x| > a_k\}} \frac{|x|}{a_n} dF(x) \\ &= \frac{1}{a_n} \sum_{k=1}^{n-1} k \int_{\{a_k < |x| \leq a_{k+1}\}} |x| dF(x) + \frac{n}{a_n} \int_{\{|x| > a_n\}} |x| dF(x) \\ &\leq \frac{1}{a_n} \int_{a_n}^{\infty} |x| a^{-1}(|x|) dF(x) + \int_{\{|x| > a_n\}} \left(\frac{a^{-1}(|x|)}{|x|} \right) |x| dF(x) \\ &\leq \frac{1}{\sqrt{a_n}} \int_{-\sqrt{a_n}}^{\sqrt{a_n}} a^{-1}(|x|) dF(x) + \int_{\{\sqrt{a_n} < |x| \leq a_n\}} a^{-1}(|x|) \\ &\quad + \int_{\{|x| > a_n\}} a^{-1}(|x|) dF(x) \rightarrow 0 \quad \text{as } n \rightarrow \infty \end{aligned}$$

since $Ea^{-1}(|X_1|) < \infty$ and $a_n \rightarrow \infty$, therefore

$$\frac{S_n}{a_n} \rightarrow 0 \quad \text{a.s.}$$

LEMMA 6. Let $a(y)$ be a nonnegative continuous function such that for some $\alpha > \frac{1}{2}$, $a(y)/y^\alpha \nearrow \infty$. Then

$$x^2 \int_{a^{-1}(|x|)}^{\infty} \frac{1}{a^2(y)} dy \leq \frac{a^{-1}(|x|)}{2\alpha - 1} \leq \frac{|x|}{2\alpha - 1} \int_1^{(a^{-1}(|x|)) \vee 1} (1/a(y)) dy + \frac{1}{2\alpha - 1}.$$

PROOF.

$$\begin{aligned} x^2 \int_{a^{-1}(|x|)}^{\infty} \left(\frac{y^{2\alpha}}{a^2(y)} \right) \left(\frac{1}{y^{2\alpha}} \right) dy &\leq x^2 \frac{[a^{-1}(|x|)]^{2\alpha}}{x^2} \int_{a^{-1}(|x|)}^{\infty} \frac{1}{y^{2\alpha}} dy \\ &= (a^{-1}(|x|))^{2\alpha} \frac{[a^{-1}(|x|)]^{1-2\alpha}}{2\alpha - 1} \\ &= \frac{(a^{-1}(|x|))}{2\alpha - 1} = \frac{1}{2\alpha - 1} \int_0^{a^{-1}(|x|)} dy \\ &\leq \frac{1}{2\alpha - 1} + (\int_1^{(a^{-1}(|x|)) \vee 1} (|x|/a(y)) dy)/2\alpha - 1. \end{aligned}$$

THEOREM 6. Let $\{X_n\}$ and $a(y)$ be as in Theorem 3. Assume also that for some $\alpha > \frac{1}{2}$, $a(y)/y^\alpha \nearrow \infty$.

The following are equivalent:

$$(15) \quad \int_{\{|x|>a_1\}} (|x| \int_1^{a^{-1}(|x|)} (1/a(y)) dy) dF(x) = \infty$$

$$(16) \quad \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} E \left(\sum_{k=1}^n \frac{X_k}{a_k} \right)^+ = \infty$$

$$(17) \quad E \sup_{n \geq 1} \frac{|S_n|}{a_n} = \infty$$

$$(18) \quad \exists t \in T_\infty \ni E \frac{|S_t|}{a_t} = \infty$$

$$(19) \quad E \sup_{n \geq 1} \frac{|X_n|}{a_n} = \infty$$

$$(20) \quad \exists t \in T_\infty \ni E \frac{|X_t|}{a_t} = \infty .$$

PROOF. By Theorem 2, when (15) holds, we have (16), (17), and (19). Conversely, if (15) is false then we appeal to Lemma 6, obtaining

$$\int_{-\infty}^{\infty} x^2 \int_{a^{-1}(|x|)}^{\infty} \frac{1}{a^2(y)} dy \leq \frac{1}{2\alpha - 1} + \frac{1}{2\alpha - 1} \int_{\{|x|>a_1\}} (|x| \int_1^{a^{-1}(|x|)} (1/a(y)) dy) dF(x) .$$

Now by Theorem 3, $\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} E \max_{1 \leq k \leq n} |\sum_{j=1}^k (X_j)/a_j| < \infty$. Hence (16) is false. As in Kronecker's lemma, let $b_0 = 0$ and $b_n = \sum_{k=1}^n (X_k)/a_k$. $X_n = a_n(b_n - b_{n-1})$ so

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{S_n}{a_n} &= \sum_{k=1}^n \frac{a_k(b_k - b_{k-1})}{a_n} = \sum_{k=1}^n \frac{a_k b_k}{a_n} - \sum_{k=1}^{n-1} \frac{a_{k+1} b_k}{a_n} \\ &= b_n - \sum_{k=1}^{n-1} \frac{(a_{k+1} - a_k) b_k}{a_n} . \end{aligned}$$

Hence $\max_{1 \leq k \leq n} |S_k|/a_k \leq 2 \max_{1 \leq k \leq n} |b_k|$, therefore

$$E \sup_{n \geq 1} \frac{|S_n|}{a_n} = \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} E \max_{1 \leq k \leq n} \frac{|S_k|}{a_k} \leq \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} 2E \max_{1 \leq k \leq n} |b_k| < \infty$$

so (17) fails and thus also (18).

$$\frac{|X_n|}{a_n} \leq \frac{|S_n|}{a_n} + \frac{|S_{n-1}|}{a_{n-1}} .$$

Hence (19) and (20) are also invalid. To complete the proof it suffices to verify that (17) \Rightarrow (18) and (19) \Rightarrow (20).

Suppose (17) holds. $\exists c_n \ni (c_n)/a_n \nearrow \infty$ and $E \sup_{n \geq 1} |S_n|/c_n = \infty$. (Take $c_n = a_n(E \max_{1 \leq k \leq n} |S_k|/a_k)^{1/2}$.) Since (15) \Leftrightarrow (17), extending c_n to a continuous function such that $c(y)/y^\alpha \nearrow$ we have

$$\int_{\{|x|>c_1\}} (|x| \int_1^{c^{-1}(|x|)} (1/c(y)) dy) dF(x) = \infty .$$

Assume that $P(|S_n| \geq c_n \text{ i.o.}) = 1$. Choose integers $0 < k_1 < k_2 < \dots$ such that $c_{k_n}/a_{k_n} \geq n^2$.

Let $t_1 = 1st j \geq k_1: |S_j|/c_j \geq 1$. Having defined t_1, \dots, t_{n-1} , let $t_n = 1st j \geq k_n + t_{n-1}: |S_j|/c_j \geq 1$. Each t_n is defined a.s.

Now introduce random variables Y_1, Y_2, \dots such that $X_1, Y_1, X_2, Y_2, \dots$ are independent and

$$\begin{aligned} Y_n &= 1 && \text{wp } 1/2n^2 \\ &= 0 && \text{otherwise.} \end{aligned}$$

Let

$$\begin{aligned} \tau &= 1st t_n: Y_n = 1 && \text{if such an } n \text{ exists} \\ &= \infty && \text{otherwise.} \end{aligned}$$

τ is a (randomized) extended-valued stopping rule.

$$\begin{aligned} E \frac{S_\tau}{a_\tau} &= \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} E \left| \frac{S_{t_n}}{a_{t_n}} 1_{\{Y_n=1, Y_1=\dots=Y_{n-1}=0\}} \right| \\ &= \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} E \frac{|S_{t_n}|}{a_{t_n}} P(Y_n = 1) (\prod_{j=1}^{n-1} P(Y_j = 0)) \\ &\geq \prod_{j=1}^{\infty} \left(1 - \frac{1}{2j^2} \right) \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} E \frac{c_{t_n}}{a_{t_n}} \left(\frac{1}{2n^2} \right) \\ &\geq \prod_{j=1}^{\infty} \left(1 - \frac{1}{2j^2} \right) \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{c_{k_n}}{(a_{k_n})} \left(\frac{1}{2n^2} \right) \\ &\geq \prod_{j=1}^{\infty} \left(1 - \frac{1}{2j^2} \right) \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{n^2}{2n^2} = \infty. \end{aligned}$$

Now assume $P(|S_n| \geq c_n \text{ i.o.}) = 0$. Then $P(|X_n| \geq 2c_n \text{ i.o.}) = 0$. $c_n/n^\alpha \nearrow \infty$ so $P(|X_n| \geq c_n \text{ i.o.}) = 0$ (Lemma 2). Choose N such that

$$\inf_{n \geq N} P(|S_{n-1}| < c_n \cap \bigcap_{j=N}^{\infty} \{|X_j| < c_j\}) > \frac{1}{2}.$$

Let

$$\begin{aligned} t &= 1st n \geq N: |X_n| \geq c_n \text{ and } |S_{n-1}| \leq c_n && \text{if such } n \text{ exists} \\ &= \infty && \text{otherwise.} \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} E \frac{|S_t|}{c_t} &\geq E \frac{|X_t|}{c_t} - 1 \\ &= \sum_{n=N}^{\infty} \frac{\int_{\{t \geq n, |S_{n-1}| < c_n, \{|X_n| \geq c_n\}} |X_n| dP}{c_n} - 1 \\ &= \sum_{n=N}^{\infty} \frac{P\{t \geq n, |S_{n-1}| < c_n\} \int_{\{|x| \geq c_n\}} |x| dF(x)}{c_n} - 1 \\ &\geq \sum_{n=N}^{\infty} \frac{P\{\bigcap_{j=N}^{\infty} \{|X_j| < c_j\}, |S_{n-1}| < c_n\} \int_{\{|x| \geq c_n\}} |x| dF(x)}{c_n} - 1 \\ &\geq \frac{1}{2} \sum_{n=N}^{\infty} \frac{\int_{\{|x| > c_n\}} |x| dF(x)}{c_n} - 1 \\ &= \infty \text{ by Corollary 1.} \end{aligned}$$

Therefore (17) \Rightarrow (18).

Lastly, assume (19) is true. Again $\exists c_n \ni c_n/a_n \nearrow \infty$ and $E \sup_{n \geq 1} |X_n|/c_n = \infty$. (Take $c_n = a_n(E \max_{1 \leq k \leq n} |X_k|/a_k)^{\frac{1}{2}}$.)

Extending c_n to a continuous function in the appropriate manner we have that

$$\int_{\{|x| > c_1\}} (|x| \int_1^{e^{-1}(|x|)} (1/c(y)) dy) dF(x) = \infty .$$

If $P(|X_n| \geq c_n \text{ i.o.}) = 1$, we proceed as in the S_τ/a_τ case, so suppose $P(|X_n| \geq c_n \text{ i.o.}) = 0$. Choose $N \ni P(\bigcap_{n=N}^\infty \{|X_n| < c_n\}) > \frac{1}{2}$.

Let

$$\begin{aligned} t = 1st \ n \geq N: & \ |X_n| \geq c_n && \text{if such an } n \text{ exists} \\ & = \infty && \text{otherwise.} \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} E \frac{|X_t|}{c_t} &= \sum_{n=N}^\infty \frac{\int_{\{t \geq n, |X_n| \geq c_n\}} |X_n| dP}{c_n} \\ &= \sum_{n=N}^\infty \frac{P(t \geq n) \int_{\{|x| \geq c_n\}} |x| dF(x)}{c_n} \\ &\geq \frac{1}{2} \left(\sum_{n=1}^\infty \frac{\int_{\{|x| \geq c_n\}} |x| dF(x)}{c_n} \right) - \sum_{n=1}^{N-1} \frac{E|X_1|}{c_n} \\ &= \infty \text{ by Corollary 1,} \end{aligned}$$

completing the entire theorem.

THEOREM 7. *Let $\{X_n\}$ be a sequence of i.i.d. mean zero random variables. Let $a(y)$ be a nonnegative continuous function such that for some $\alpha > \frac{1}{2}$, $a(y)/y^\alpha \nearrow$. Assume also that $\limsup_{y \rightarrow \infty} (a(y))/y > 0$.*

Then (21)—(25) are equivalent.

$$(21) \quad \int_{a_1}^\infty x \int_1^{a^{-1}(x)} (1/a(y)) dy dF(x) = \infty$$

$$(22) \quad E \sup_{n \geq 1} \frac{S_n^+}{a_n} = \infty$$

$$(23) \quad \exists t \in T_\infty \ni E \frac{S_t}{a_t} = \infty$$

$$(24) \quad E \sup_{n \geq 1} \frac{X_n^+}{a_n} = \infty$$

$$(25) \quad \exists t \in T_\infty \ni E \frac{X_t^+}{a_t} = \infty .$$

PROOF. Assume (21). Let

$$\begin{aligned} t = 1st \ k: & \ X_k \geq a_k && \text{if such } k \text{ exists} \\ & = \infty && \text{otherwise.} \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
E \frac{X_t}{a_t} &= \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{\int_{\{t=n\}} X_n dP}{a_n} \\
&= \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{\int_{\{t \geq n, X_n \geq a_n\}} X_n dP}{a_n} = \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{P(t \geq n) \int_{a_n}^{\infty} x dF(x)}{a_n} \\
&\geq P(t = \infty) \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{\int_{a_n}^{\infty} x dF(x)}{a_n} \\
&\geq P(t = \infty) \left(-\frac{EX_1^+}{a_1} + \int_{a_1}^{\infty} (x \int_1^{a^{-1}(x)} (1/a(y)) dy) dF(x) \right) \quad (\text{by Lemma 1}) \\
&= \infty.
\end{aligned}$$

Therefore (21) \Rightarrow (25) \Rightarrow (24).

For $j < n$,

$$\begin{aligned}
\int_{\{t=n\}} X_j dP &= \frac{P(t=n)}{P(X_j < a_j)} \int_{a_j}^{\infty} x dF(x) \\
&= P(t=n)E(X_j | X_j < a_j) \geq P(t=n)E(X_1 | X_1 < a_1).
\end{aligned}$$

As in McCabe and Shepp [7] and Klass [6],

$$\begin{aligned}
E \frac{S_{t-1}}{a_t} &= \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{\sum_{j=1}^{n-1} \int_{\{t=n\}} X_j dP}{a_n} \geq \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{P(t=n)E(X_1 | X_1 < a_1)(n-1)}{a_n} \\
&\geq E(X_1 | X_1 < a_1) \sup_{n \geq 1} \frac{n}{a_n} > -\infty.
\end{aligned}$$

Therefore $E(S_t/a_t) = \infty$ and (21) \Rightarrow (23) \Rightarrow (22).

Conversely, we verify that if (21) fails, then (22)—(25) are also false.

Let $Y_n = X_n^+ - EX_n^+$. $\{Y_n\}$ is a sequence of i.i.d. mean zero random variables which is bounded below. Hence

$$EX_1^+ \int_1^{a^{-1}(X_1^+)^{\vee 1}} (1/a(y)) dy < \infty \Rightarrow E|Y_1| \int_1^{a^{-1}(|Y_1|)^{\vee 1}} (1/a(y)) dy < \infty.$$

Let $T_n = Y_1 + \dots + Y_n$.

Invoking Theorem 6, $E \sup_{n \geq 1} |T_n|/a_n < \infty$ and $E \sup_{n \geq 1} |Y_n|/a_n < \infty$.

$$\begin{aligned}
E \sup_{n \geq 1} \frac{S_n^+}{a_n} &\leq E \sup_{n \geq 1} \frac{\sum_{j=1}^n X_j^+}{a_n} \leq E \sup_{n \geq 1} \frac{\sum_{j=1}^n Y_j}{a_n} + E \sup_{n \geq 1} \frac{\sum_{j=1}^n EX_j^+}{a_n} \\
&= E \sup_{n \geq 1} \frac{T_n}{a_n} + \sup_{n \geq 1} \frac{nEX_1^+}{a_n} < \infty,
\end{aligned}$$

so (22) and (23) fail.

$$E \sup_{n \geq 1} \frac{X_n^+}{a_n} \leq E \sup_{n \geq 1} \frac{Y_n + EX_n^+}{a_n} \leq E \sup_{n \geq 1} \frac{Y_n}{a_n} + \sup_{n \geq 1} \frac{EX_1^+}{a_n} < \infty.$$

Hence (24) and (25) are also invalid, thereby completing the entire proof.

A couple of examples are in order to illustrate some of the results.

EXAMPLE 2. Let $a_n = n^{1/\alpha}$ for some $1 < \alpha < 2$.

$$\begin{aligned} \int_{\{|x|>1\}} |x| \int_1^{|x|^\alpha} \frac{1}{y^{1/\alpha}} dy dF(x) &= \int_{\{|x|>1\}} |x| \frac{y^{1-1/\alpha}}{1-1/\alpha} \Big|_1^{|x|^\alpha} dF(x) \\ &= \frac{\alpha}{\alpha-1} \int_{\{|x|>1\}} (|x|^\alpha - |x|) dF(x). \end{aligned}$$

Hence $E|X|^\alpha < \infty \iff E \sup_{n \geq 1} |S_n|/n^{1/\alpha} < \infty$. Also,

$$\begin{aligned} E|X|^\alpha < \infty &\implies \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} E \left| \sum_{k=1}^n \frac{X_k}{k^{1/\alpha}} \right| < \infty \\ &\implies \sum_{k=1}^\infty \frac{X_k}{k^{1/\alpha}} \text{ converges a.s.} \\ &\implies \frac{S_n}{n^{1/\alpha}} \rightarrow 0 \text{ a.s.} \end{aligned}$$

Whenever $E|X|^\alpha < \infty \exists \tau \in T_\infty \ni$

$$(26) \quad E \frac{S_\tau}{\tau^{1/\alpha}} = \sup_{t \in T_\infty} E \frac{S_t}{t^{1/\alpha}} < \infty .$$

Theorem 6 also shows that $E|X|^\alpha < \infty$ is necessary for (26).

EXAMPLE 3. Let $a_n = (n \log n)$ for $n \geq 3$ and extend it appropriately for $n = 1$ and 2.

$$a^{-1}(y) > \frac{y}{\log y} \quad \text{for } y \geq e$$

$$\begin{aligned} \lim_{x \rightarrow \infty} \frac{\int_e^{a^{-1}(x)} \left(\frac{1}{a(y)} \right) dy}{\int_{a^{-1}(x)}^x \left(\frac{1}{a(y)} \right) dy} &\geq \lim_{x \rightarrow \infty} \frac{\int_e^{x/\log x} \left(\frac{1}{y \log y} \right) dy}{\int_{x/\log x}^x \left(\frac{1}{y \log y} \right) dy} \\ &= \lim_{x \rightarrow \infty} \frac{\log \log \frac{x}{\log x}}{\log \log x - \log \log \frac{x}{\log x}} \\ &= \lim_{x \rightarrow \infty} \frac{\log \log x}{(\log \log x)/\log x} = \infty \quad \text{therefore,} \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} \int_{a_1}^\infty x \int_1^{a^{-1}(x)} (1/a(y)) dy dF(x) &< \infty \\ \iff \int_e^\infty \left(x \int_e^x \frac{1}{y \log y} dy \right) dF(x) \\ &= \int_e^\infty x \log \log x dF(x) < \infty . \end{aligned}$$

Recalling the appropriate theorems, it is apparent that $EX_1^+ \log^+ \log X_1 < \infty$ is necessary and sufficient for there to exist $\tau \in T_\infty \ni$

$$E \frac{S_\tau}{(\tau \log \tau) \vee 1} = \sup_{t \in T_\infty} E \frac{S_t}{(t \log t) \vee 1} < \infty .$$

More generally, let $\log_{(0)} x = x$ and $\log_{(n)} x = \log(\log_{(n-1)} x)$. It is easy to verify that $\exists \tau \in T_\infty \ni$

$$E \frac{S_\tau}{(\log_{(0)} \tau \log_{(1)} \tau \cdots \log_{(n)} \tau) \vee 1}$$

$$= \sup_{t \in T_\infty} E \frac{S_t}{(\log_{(0)} \tau \log_{(1)} t \cdots \log_{(n)} t) \vee 1} < \infty$$

iff $EX_1^+ \log_{(n+1)}^+ X_1^+ < \infty$.

REFERENCES

- [1] BURKHOLDER, D. L. (1962). Successive conditional expectation of an integrable function. *Ann. Math. Statist.* **33** 887-893.
- [2] CHOW, Y. S., ROBBINS, H. and SIEGMUND, D. (1971). *Great Expectations: The Theory of Optimal Stopping*. Houghton Mifflin, New York.
- [3] CHUNG, KAI LAI (1968). *A Course in Probability Theory*. Harcourt, Brace, and World, New York.
- [4] DAVIS, BURGESS (1971). Stopping rules for S_n/n and the class $L \log L$. *Z. Wahrscheinlichkeitstheorie und Verw. Gebiete* **17** 147-150.
- [5] GUNDY, R. F. (1969). On the class $L \log L$ martingales and singular integrals, *Studia Math.* **33** 109-118.
- [6] KLASS, M. (1973). Properties of optimal extended-valued stopping rules for S_n/n . *Ann. Probability* **1** 719-757.
- [7] MCCABE, B. J. and SHEPP, L. A. (1970). On the supremum of S_n/n . *Ann. Math. Statist.* **41** 2166-2168.
- [8] SIEGMUND, D. O. (1967). Some problems in the theory of optimal stopping rules. *Ann. Math. Statist.* **38** 1627-1640.

DEPARTMENT OF MATHEMATICS
CALIFORNIA INSTITUTE OF TECHNOLOGY
PASADENA, CALIFORNIA 91109