# A CONSTRUCTION OF METRICS OF NEGATIVE RICCI CURVATURE

# ROBERT BROOKS

In this paper we will prove

**Theorem 1.** Every compact 3-manifold admits a metric of negative Ricci curvature.

This theorem was originally proved by Gao and Yau in [2]. The proof we give here, while based on [2], is substantially shorter, given signficant results about hyperbolic 3-manifolds, and is (to our taste) more constructive and conceptual. The simplicity comes from staying as long as possible in the category of hyperbolic metrics. In particular, we make strong use of the existence of tubular neighborhoods of specified width about short geodesics. This theory follows from Jorgensen's inequality [4] and was developed in [1] and [7].

Our construction is flexible enough to give

**Theorem 2.** There exist positive constants a and b such that every compact 3-manifold admits a metric whose Ricci curvatures all lie between -a and -b.

Observe that if M admits a metric whose Ricci curvatures lie between -a and -b, where b/a < 2, then this metric has negative sectional curvature. Our argument gives a ratio of b/a on the order of 1,000, but we do not compute it explicitly.

We also obtain results about higher-dimensional manifolds carrying metrics of negative Ricci curvature:

**Theorem 3.** Let M be a hyperbolic orbifold of order k, where  $k \geq 12$ . Then M admits a metric of negative Ricci curvature.

The terminology "hyperbolic orbifold of order k" is explained in §4. The proof of Theorem 3 was motivated by the paper [3], which has a number of points of contact with the present paper.

The plan of our argument is as follows.

Given a 3-manifold M, it follows from the Thurston theory [8] that there is a link L in M such that M-L has a complete metric of constant curvature

Received July 2, 1987. The author was partially supported by National Science Foundation Grant DMS-8501300.

-1. Furthermore, for n sufficiently large, we may find a metric on M itself which is hyperbolic away from L, but which has an orbifold singularity about L of order n. This is discussed in detail in §1.

We then consider in §§2 and 3 the problem of smoothing out the metric along L. To do this, we argue in §2 that about each component  $\gamma$  of L, there is a tubular neighborhood  $T_n(\gamma)$  of radius  $r_n(\gamma)$ , such that all the tubular neighborhoods are disjoint. We then provide estimates on the size of  $r_n(\gamma)$ .

Finally in §3 we show how to modify the metric in each tubular neighborhood to preserve negative curvature. We are led to a family of differential inequalities which must be met in order to retain negative Ricci curvature. We find that if the tubular neighborhood is sufficiently large, then this can be done. We also show that the tubular neighborhoods found in §2 are sufficiently large to carry out this construction. In §4, we then consider the case of dimensions greater than 3.

It is a pleasure to thank Bob Greene for bringing the paper [2] to our attention, and Paul Yang and L. Z. Gao for helpful conversations. We would also like to thank Anatole Katok, Rick Schoen, and S. T. Yau for their interest and support.

#### 1. The singular metrics

Let M be a compact 3-manifold. Then there exists a link  $L \subset M$  such that M - L has a complete hyperbolic structure of finite volume.

There are two ways of seeing this. One way is to appeal to a theorem of Thurston [8] that every 3-manifold can be obtained from the 3-sphere  $S^3$  by doing Dehn surgery on a link whose complement has a hyperbolic structure. Another way is to appeal to the easier theorem [5] that every 3-manifold M arises as a branched covering  $f: M \to S^3$  of  $D^3$  whose branching locus on  $S^3$  is the figure-eight knot. Since the figure-eight knot complement has a well-known hyperbolic structure, we may lift this to obtain a complete hyperbolic structure on M-L, where  $L=f^{-1}$  (figure-eight knot) is the branching locus of f in M.

Let  $\gamma_1, \dots, \gamma_k$  be the components of L. Then for each k-tuple of pairs of integers  $\prod_i (p_i, q_i)$ ,  $i = 1, \dots, k$ , we may obtain a manifold  $M^{\prod(p_i, q_i)}$  by removing a tubular neighborhood of  $\gamma_i$  and replacing it with a new identification of the boundary. Furthermore, when all the  $(p_i, q_i)$ 's are sufficiently large,  $M^{\prod(p_i, q_i)}$ , has a hyperbolic metric. This is Thurston's hyperbolic Dehn surgery [8]. We choose the ordering of  $(p_i, q_i)$  such that  $M^{\prod(0,1)} = M$ .

When  $p_i$  and  $q_i$  are relatively prime, the hyperbolic metric on  $M^{\prod(p_i,q_i)}$  is smooth. However, if  $(p_i,q_i)=n(p_i',q_i')$ , with  $p_i'$  and  $q_i'$  relatively prime, then

the metric on  $M^{\prod(p_i,q_i)}$  is branched about  $\gamma_i$  of order n—in a neighborhood of  $\gamma_i$  the metric looks like the quotient of hyperbolic space by rotation through angle  $2\pi/n$  about a geodesic line.

We may compute the metric about a  $\gamma_i$  as follows: let  $\gamma$  be a geodesic line in hyperbolic space. We may describe the metric in a tubular neighborhood of  $\gamma$  in Fermi coordinates by

$$ds^{2} = (\cosh^{2}(r)) dt^{2} + dr^{2} + (\sinh^{2}(r)) d\theta^{2},$$

where t is the coordinate along the geodesic, r is the radial coordinate, and  $\theta$  the angular coordinate. Quotienting out by a rotation of  $2\pi/n$  gives the metric

$$ds^2 = (\cosh^2(r)) dt^2 + (dr)^2 + \left(\frac{\sinh(r)}{n}\right)^2 d\theta^2.$$

Observe that a metric of the form

$$ds^{2} = q^{2}(r) dt^{2} + (dr)^{2} + f^{2}(r) d\theta^{2}$$

will be smooth at r = 0 provided

$$f(0) = 0$$
,  $f'(0) = 1$ ,  $g(0) > 0$ ,  $g'(0) = 0$ .

In conclusion, we have:

**Lemma 1.** Given M, and a link L such that M-L has a hyperbolic structure, and suitably large integers  $n_i$ , there is a metric on  $M = M^{\prod(0,n_i)}$  which is hyperbolic away from the link, and which is of the form

$$ds^2 = (\cosh^2(r)) dt^2 + (dr)^2 + \left(\frac{\sinh(r)}{n_i}\right)^2 d\theta^2$$

in Fermi coordinates about each component  $\gamma_i$  of L.

## 2. Tubular neighborhoods

Let M be a hyperbolic 3-manifold, and  $\gamma$  a closed geodesic in M. Then there is an element A in  $PSL(2, \mathbb{C})$  whose axis is  $\gamma$ , and whose complex translation length  $\tau$  is defined by

$$tr(A) = \pm 2\cosh(\tau/2).$$

In [1], it is shown that, if  $|\sinh(\tau/2)| < 1/\sqrt{6}$ , then there is a tubular neighborhood  $T(\gamma)$  of radius r, where

(\*) 
$$\sinh^2(r) = \frac{1}{4|\sinh(\tau/2)|^2} - \frac{3}{2},$$

and, furthermore, corresponding tubular neighborhoods about disjoint short  $(|\sinh(\tau/2)| < 1/\sqrt{6})$  geodesics are disjoint. Slightly sharper estimates appear in [7] (see also §4 below), but the estimate (\*) suffices for our purposes.

We apply these considerations to the branched coverings of our manifold M which unwind the singularity about  $\gamma_i$ . In this manifold,  $\gamma_i$  is the axis of rotation by  $2\pi/n$ , and one sees easily that a tubular neighborhood in the covering descends to a tubular neighborhood of  $\gamma_i$  in M. We therefore may apply the above considerations to  $\tau/2 = i\pi/n$  to see that there is a tubular neighborhood about  $\gamma_i$  in M of radius  $r_i$  where

$$\sinh^2(r_i) = \frac{1}{4\sin^2(\pi/n_i)} - \frac{3}{2} \sim C \cdot n_i^2,$$

where  $C \sim 1/2\pi$ .

In particular, we observe that  $r_i \to \infty$  as  $n_i \to \infty$ , and  $\sinh(r_i)/n_i \to 1/2\pi > 0$  as  $n_i \to \infty$ .

## 3. Negative Ricci curvature

Let us begin with a tubular neighborhood of a geodesic in which the metric is of the form

$$ds^2 = g^2 dt^2 + dr^2 + f^2 d\theta^2.$$

This will describe a metric of negative Ricci curvature provided

- (a) g''/g + f''/f > 0,
- (b)  $g''/g + (g'/g) \cdot (f'/f) > 0$ ,
- (c)  $f''/f + (g'/g) \cdot (f'/f) > 0$ .

Theorem 1 will be proved once we show:

**Theorem 4.** For n sufficiently large, there are functions g(r), f(r) such that

- (i) conditions (a)-(c) are fulfilled,
- (ii) For  $r > r_n$ , where  $\sinh(r_n) = C \cdot n$ ,  $C < 1/2\pi$ , we have  $g(r) \equiv \cosh(r)$  and  $f(r) \equiv \sinh(r)/n$ ,
  - (iii) f(0) = 0, f'(0) = 1, g(0) > 0, and g'(0) = 0.

**Proof.** We will construct f and g in the following way. First, we will describe f and g piecewise so as to satisfy (i)-(iii). Then we will show how to smooth out the singularities to obtain smooth f and g satisfying (a)-(c).

To smooth out the singularities, we will use the following two elementary lemmas. Lemma 2 was proved in [2].

**Lemma 2** [2]. Let  $f_1$ ,  $f_2$  be positive strictly increasing functions with  $f_1'', f_2'' > 0$ .

Suppose that  $f_1(a) = f_2(a)$  and  $f'_1(a) < f'_2(a)$ . Then for b < a < c, there exists a smooth function f such that f is strictly increasing, f'' > 0, and  $f(r) = f_1(r)$  for r < b,  $f(r) = f_2(r)$  for r > c.

**Lemma 3.** Let  $f_1$ ,  $f_2$  and g be positive strictly increasing,  $f_2'' > 0$ , g'' > 0, and  $(f_1,g)$  and  $(f_2,g)$  satisfy (a)-(c). Suppose that  $f_1(a) = f_2(a)$  and  $f_1'(a) < f_2'(a)$ . Then for b < a < c, there exists a smooth function f such that (f,g) satisfy (a)-(c), and  $f(r) = f_1(r)$  for r < b and  $f(r) = f_2(r)$  for r > c.

*Proof.* If  $f_1''(a) > 0$ , this is just Lemma 2. So we may assume  $f_1''(a) < 0$ . Let us set  $\varepsilon = r - a$ , and choose  $\varepsilon_0$  such that if  $c_{\varepsilon 0} = f_2(r + \varepsilon_0)$ , then,

- (a')  $g''/g + f_1''/c_{\epsilon 0} > 0$  for  $|r a| < \epsilon_0$ ,
- (b')  $f_1''/c_{\epsilon 0} + (g'/g)f_1'/c_{\epsilon 0} > 0$  for  $|r a| < \epsilon_0$ ,
- (c')  $g''/g + (g'/g)f'_1/c_{\epsilon 0} > 0$  for  $|r a| < \epsilon_0$ .

Now choose  $c > \sup |f_1''(\varepsilon)|$  for  $|\varepsilon| < \varepsilon_0$ . Given  $\delta$ , consider the function  $h_{\delta}$  which is 0 for  $\varepsilon < -\delta/c$ , and which is c for  $\varepsilon > -\delta/c$ , and define  $f_3$  by

$$f_3(\varepsilon) = f_1(\varepsilon)$$
 for  $\varepsilon < -\delta/c$ ,  $f_3'' = f_1'' + h_\delta$ 

so that

$$f_3' = f_1' + c^{\varepsilon} + \delta \quad \text{for } \varepsilon \ge -\frac{\delta}{c},$$

$$f_3' = f_1' \quad \text{for } \varepsilon \le -\frac{\delta}{c},$$

$$f_3 = f_1 + \frac{\varepsilon^2 c}{2} + \delta \varepsilon + \frac{\delta^2}{2c} \quad \text{for } \varepsilon \ge -\frac{\delta}{c}$$

$$= f_1 \quad \text{for } \varepsilon \le -\frac{\delta}{c}.$$

By choosing  $\varepsilon_1$  and  $\delta$  small, we have  $f_3' < f_2'$  for  $|\varepsilon| < \varepsilon_1$ . Note that

$$f_3(0) = f_1(0) + \frac{\delta^2}{2c} > f_2(0).$$

We now want to arrange it so that  $f_3(\varepsilon_1) < f_2(\varepsilon_1)$ . Since  $f_2''(a) > 0$ , we have  $f_2(\varepsilon) > f_2(0) + f_2'(0) \cdot \varepsilon$  and since  $f_1''(a) < 0$ , we have

$$f_3(\varepsilon) < f_1(0) + f_1'(0) \cdot \varepsilon + \frac{\varepsilon^2 c}{2} + \delta \varepsilon + \frac{\delta^2}{2c}$$

and from  $f_1(0) = f_2(0)$ , we must show that

$$f_1'(0) \cdot \varepsilon_1 + \frac{\varepsilon_1^2 c}{2} + \delta \varepsilon_1 + \frac{\delta^2}{2c} < f_2'(0) \cdot \varepsilon_1.$$

We now choose  $\varepsilon_1$  sufficiently small so that

$$(f_2'(0) - f_1'(0))\varepsilon_1 - \frac{\varepsilon_1^2 c}{2} > 0,$$

and then  $\delta$  sufficiently small so that

$$\delta \varepsilon_1 - \frac{\delta^2}{2c} < (f_2'(0) - f_1'(0))\varepsilon_1 - \frac{\varepsilon_1^2 c}{2}.$$

It follows that there is a point x between a and  $a+\varepsilon$ , at which  $f_3(x)=f_2(x)$ , and we have already shown that  $f_3'(x) < f_2'(x)$ . Furthermore,  $f_3''(x) > 0$  by construction.

To see that  $(f_3, g)$  satisfies (a)-(c), we observe that  $f_3(r) < f_2(r + \varepsilon_0)$ , since  $f_3$  is increasing and  $f_3(x) = f_2(x)$ . Furthermore,  $f_3'' \ge f_1''$ ,  $f_3' \ge f_1'$ , so the fact that  $f_3$  satisfies (a)-(c) follows from the fact that this is true for  $f_1$ .

 $f_3$  is not smooth at  $-\delta/c$ , but by approximating  $h_{\delta}$  by a smooth function  $k_{\delta}$ , and defining  $f_4$  by  $f_4 = f_1$  for  $\varepsilon < -\delta/c$ ,  $f_4'' = f_1'' + k_{\delta}$ , we see that  $f_4$  possesses the same properties we have demonstrated for  $f_3$ , and that  $f_4$  is smooth

Finally, we apply Lemma 2 to  $f_4$  and  $f_2$  at x (where  $f_4'' > 0$ ) to obtain a smooth function f which satisfies the conclusion of the lemma.

To prove Theorem 4, we first apply Lemma 3 to

$$f_1 = rac{1}{\lambda_1} \arctan(\lambda_1 r), \quad f_2 = rac{\sinh(r)}{n}, \quad g = lpha(\cosh(\lambda_2 r)).$$

Notice that  $\arctan$  is an increasing function whose second derivative is negative, and that  $\arctan(x) < \pi/2$  for all x. It follows that, given D > 0, for  $\lambda_1$  sufficiently large, there is a point  $r_0$  such that

$$f_1(r_0) = f_2(r_0) < D$$
 and  $f'_1(r_0) < f'_2(r_0)$ .

We will fix D later.

 $f_2$  and g are visibly positive increasing functions whose second derivative is positive. Note also that  $f_1(0) = 0$ ,  $f'_1(0) = 1$ .

We now must show  $f_1$  and g satisfy (a)-(c). Condition (a) then becomes

$$\lambda_2^2 - \lambda_1^2 \frac{\sinh(\lambda_1 r)}{\cosh^2(\lambda_1 r) \arctan(\lambda_1 r)} > 0$$

or  $\lambda_2^2 \arctan(\lambda_1 r) > \lambda_1^2 \sinh(\lambda_1 r) / \cosh^2(\lambda_1 r)$ .

Noting that one gets 0=0 when r=0, and taking derivatives, one sees that (a) is fulfilled when  $\lambda_2 > \lambda_1$ . Condition (b) is trivially fulfilled, since g, g', g'', and f' are all positive. Condition (c) becomes

$$-\lambda_1^2\frac{\sinh(\lambda_1 r)}{\cosh^2(\lambda_1 r)\arctan(\lambda_1 r)} + \left(\lambda_2\frac{\sinh(\lambda_2 r)}{\cosh(\lambda_2 r)}\right)\left(\lambda_1\frac{1}{\cosh(\lambda_1 r)\arctan(\lambda_1 r)}\right).$$

Since  $\tanh$  is an increasing function, this will again be fulfilled when  $\lambda_2 > \lambda_1$ .

We now would like to join up  $\alpha \cosh(\lambda_2 r)$  and  $\cosh(r)$ , but it is easy to see that, for  $\lambda_2$  large, for the value of  $\alpha$  where  $\alpha \cosh(\lambda_2 r)$  meets  $\cosh(r)$ , the derivative of  $\alpha \cosh(\lambda_2 r)$  is greater, so that Lemma 2 does not apply directly. We therefore proceed in two steps. Let  $r_n$  be the value of n such that  $\sinh(r_n)/n = C$ .

Let  $g_3 = \cosh(r)$  and let  $g_2 = \cosh(r_n) + k(r - r_n)$ , where k is close to but less than  $\sinh(r_n)$ . Then  $g_2(r_n) = g_3(r_n)$ ,  $g_2'(r_n) < g_3'(r_n)$  and Lemma 2 applies with  $f = \sinh(r)/n$ , since  $g_2$ ,  $g_3$ , and f all have nonnegative first and second derivatives.

Now observe that  $g_2$  meets the x-axis at a point  $> r_n - \beta$ , for  $\beta = \coth(r_n)$  slightly larger than 1. We now may choose  $\alpha$  sufficiently small so that  $g_1(r) = \alpha \cosh(\lambda_2 r)$  meets  $g_2$  at a point between  $r_n - \beta$  and  $r_n$  where  $g_1' < g_2' = k$ . We now apply Lemma 2 twice to obtain a function g which agrees with  $\alpha \cosh(\lambda_2 r)$  for  $r < r_n - \beta$ , and with  $\cosh(r)$  for  $r > r_n$ .

As soon as  $r_n - \beta > 0$ , we may choose  $\lambda_1$  sufficiently large so that  $(\lambda_1)^{-1} \arctan(\lambda_1 r)$  never exceeds  $(\sinh(r_n) - \beta)/n$ , and  $\lambda_2$  accordingly. This will happen as soon as  $r_n \geq \coth(r_n)$ , that is,  $r_n \geq 1.19968$ . From (\*) of §2, this will happen when  $n \geq 14$ .

From the equality

$$\sinh(r - \beta) = \sinh(r)\cosh(\beta) - \cosh(r)\sinh(\beta)$$

and  $\sinh(r_n)/n = C$ , we see that for n large (so that  $\sinh(r_n)$  is close to  $\cosh(r_n)$ ),

$$\frac{\sinh(r_n - \beta)}{n} > \sim C(\cosh(\beta) - \sinh(\beta)).$$

We may now take  $D = C(\cosh(\beta) - \sinh(\beta))$ . Noting that  $\beta$ , and hence D, do not depend on  $\lambda_2$  we may now choose  $\lambda_1$  so that  $(\lambda_1)^{-1}$  arctan never exceeds D; hence for large n we may choose  $\lambda_1$  and  $\lambda_2$  independent of n.

This proves Theorem 4, and hence Theorem 1. To prove Theorem 2, we make use of the following refinement of [5].

**Theorem** ([6]): Let L be the Borromean rings link in  $S^3$ . Then any 3-manifold M arises as a branched covering of  $f: M \to S^3$ , whose branch locus is L, such that the order of branching is 1, 2, or 4 on each component of  $f^{-1}(L)$ .

To prove Theorem 2, choose  $n_0$  divisible by 4, sufficiently large so that doing  $(0, n_0)$ -Dehn surgery on each component of the Boormean rings gives a hyperbolic metric on  $S^3$ , branched of order  $n_0$  along L, and such that  $n_0/4 \ge 14$ .

It follows that, for every 3-manifold M, there is a link L such that M has a hyperbolic metric which is branched of order  $n_0$ ,  $n_0/2$ , or  $n_0/4$  along each

component of L. Therefore, in our proof of Theorem 4, we need only take n to be one of these three values. The existence of a and b as in Theorem 2 is now immediate.

We remark that one could probably greatly improve on this  $n_0$ , giving better estimates for a and b, but doing so would take us out of the scope of this paper.

# 4. Manifolds of higher dimension

Let M be a manifold of dimension n > 3. We will say that M is a hyperbolic orbifold of order k if there is a codimension 2 hypersurface X in M such that M carries a hyperbolic metric which is smooth and of constant curvature -1 away from X, and in a neighborhood of X looks like the quotient of hyperbolic space by an element of order k fixing a geodesic codimension 2 hyperbolic space:

In this section, we will show:

**Theorem 3.** Let M be a hyperbolic orbifold of order k, where  $k \geq 12$ . Then M admits a metric of negative Ricci curvature.

**Proof.** We proceed as before. We may choose "Fermi coordinates"  $x_1, \dots, x_{n-2}, r$ , and  $\theta$  about x, where  $x_1, \dots, x_{n-2}$  are coordinates for the fixed-point set, r the distance from the fixed-point set, and  $\theta$  the angular coordinate.

Let us compute the Ricci curvature of a metric in a tubular neighborhood of x of the form

$$ds^{2} = g^{2}(r) dx^{2} + f^{2}(r) d\theta^{2}.$$

The Ricci curvatures are

$$\begin{split} &-\left((n-3)+\frac{g''}{g}+\frac{g'}{g}\cdot\frac{f'}{f}\right),\\ &-\left((n-2)\frac{g''}{g}+\frac{f''}{f}\right),\\ &-\left((n-2)\frac{g'}{g}\cdot\frac{f'}{f}+\frac{f''}{f}\right). \end{split}$$

We seek functions f and g satisfying these equations, and also satisfying

$$f(0) = 0,$$
  $f'(0) = 1,$   
 $f(r) = \frac{\sinh(r)}{k}$  for  $r > r_0,$   
 $g(r) = \cosh(r)$  for  $r > r_0.$ 

We now observe that in our solutions to these questions when n=3, our solutions f and g satisfied that f, f', g, g' and g'' were all positive. Therefore,

these solutions are also solutions to the present equations, so that we have solved these equations provided that X has a tubular neighborhood of radius  $r_0$  such that  $r_0 > \coth(r_0)$ , i.e., such that  $r_0 > 1.19968$ .

We now want to estimate  $r_0$  in terms of k, but at first sight the results of [1] are unavailable to us.

A generalization of [1], valid for elliptic elements A fixing a geodesic hypersurface of codimension 2, was given in [3]. Since we will want sharper constants than those given there, we will repeat the argument here.

**Lemma 4** [3]. Let X and M be as above. Then X has a tubular neighborhood of radius  $r_0$ , where

$$2\sin(\pi/k)\cosh(r_0) = 1.$$

**Proof.** In hyperbolic space, let  $\gamma$  be a geodesic of minimal length joining two distinct lifts of X, and let  $\lambda = \operatorname{length}(\gamma)$ . Then  $A(\gamma)$  is another such, and makes angle  $2\pi/k$  with  $\gamma$ . The geodesic joining the other ends of  $\gamma$  and  $A(\gamma)$  then forms an isosceles triangle in hyperbolic space, with sides of length  $\lambda$  and angle  $2\pi/k$ . By elementary hyperbolic trigonometry, the opposite side has length 2x, where

$$\sinh(x)/\sinh(\lambda) = \sin(\pi/k).$$

We must have  $2x \ge \lambda$  by construction, so

$$\sinh(\lambda/2)/\sinh(\lambda) \le \sin(\pi/k)$$

or  $2\cosh(\lambda/2)\sin(\pi/k) \ge 1$ .

Since the width of the tubular neighborhood is  $\lambda/2$ , this gives the lemma. It follows that we get a tubular neighborhood of radius  $r_0 = 1.19968$  when k is at least 12.

We remark that it is not too difficult to construct such M and X by arithmetic methods, giving interesting examples of manifolds with negative Ricci curvature, but at present we have little feeling for the topology of such M.

#### References

- R. Brooks & J. P. Matelski, Collars in Kleinian groups, Duke Math. J. 43 (1982) 163– 182.
- [2] L. Gao & S. T. Yau, The existence of negatively Ricci curved metrics of 3-manifolds, Invent. Math. 85 (1986) 637-652.
- [3] M. Gromov & W. Thurston, Pinching constants for hyperbolic manifolds, Invent. Math. 89 (1987) 1-12.
- [4] T. Jorgensen, On discrete groups of Mobius transformations, Amer. J. Math. 98 (1976) 739-749.

- [5] H. M. Hilden, M. T. Lozano & J. M. Montesinos, On knots that are universal, Topology 24 (1985) 499-504.
- [6] H. M. Hilden, M. T. Lozano, J. M. Montesinos & W. C. Whitten, On Universal groups and three-manifolds, Invent. Math. 87 (1987) 441-456.
- [7] R. Meyerhoff, A lower bound on the volume of hyperbolic 3-manifolds, preprint.
- [8] W. Thurston, The geometry and topology of 3-manifolds, Princeton Lecture Notes.

University of Southern California