# ON THE JAMES, SAMELSON AND WHITEHEAD PRODUCTS 

John W. Rutter and Christopher B. Spencer

(Received Dec. 10, 1969)

Introduction. Let $C_{W}$ be the mapping cone on the Whitehead product map $W: A * B \rightarrow S A \vee S B$, then we define in $\S 2$ maps $h: C_{W} \rightarrow S A \times S B$ and $k: S(A * B)$ $\rightarrow S A \# S B$ each of which is a homotopy equivalence if $A$ and $B$ are $C W$ complexes. Given that $Y$ has a multiplication with homotopy identity, we construct in $\S 3$ a homotopy product $[S A, Y] \times[S B, Y] \rightarrow[S(A * B), Y]$ which is James's product in case $A$ and $B$ are spheres and $Y$ has strict identity. With restrictions on $P$ and $Q$, two Samelson products $[P, Y] \times[Q, Y] \rightarrow[P \# Q, Y]$ are defined in $\S 4$. In case $A$ and $B$ have non degenerate base point and $P=S A$ and $Q=S B$, these Samelson products correspond to the James product (theorem 5.1) under the homomorphism $k^{*}:[S A \# S B, Y] \rightarrow[S(A * B), Y]$. In $\S 6$ linearity properties and the Jacobi identity are given for the James and Samelson product.

1. Preliminaries. The functors of unreduced join, suspension and cone are denoted $\widetilde{*}, \widetilde{S}$ and $\widetilde{C}$; the unreduced mapping cone on $f: X \rightarrow Y$ is denoted $\widetilde{C}_{f}$. The symbols used for the reduced join, suspension, cone and mapping cone in the base point category are $*, S, C$ and $C_{f}$; in this category $\vee$ and \# denote the wedge and collapsed product, and $X \# I=X \times I / * \times I$. The category of based spaces having the base point preserving homotopy type of $C W$ complexes is denoted $\mathscr{W}$.
2. The functorial equivalences. Let $\widetilde{W}: A \widetilde{*} B \rightarrow \widetilde{S} A \vee \widetilde{S} B$ be the projection defined by

$$
\widetilde{W}(a, b, t)= \begin{cases}(*,(b, 2 t)) & t \leqslant 1 / 2 \\ ((a, 2-2 t), *) & t \geqslant 1 / 2\end{cases}
$$

where $\widetilde{S A}$ and $\widetilde{S B}$ are joined together at the 1 -end of the suspensions: then $\widetilde{W}$ is an unbased Whitehead product (c. f. ${ }^{1{ }^{1}} 2.3$ of [1]).

[^0]

Consider now the induced cofibre sequence

$$
A \widetilde{*} B \xrightarrow{\widetilde{W}} \widetilde{S} A \vee \widetilde{S} B \xrightarrow{j} \widetilde{C}_{\widetilde{W}} \longrightarrow S(A \widetilde{*} B) \rightarrow \cdots
$$

We show that this sequence, less the first term, is continuously bijective with a cofibre sequence induced by the inclusion $i: \widetilde{S} A \vee \widetilde{S} B \rightarrow \widetilde{S} A \times \widetilde{S} B$.

Proposition 2.1. There are functorial continuous bijections ${ }^{1)} \widetilde{h}: \widetilde{C}_{\widetilde{W}} \rightarrow$ $\widetilde{S} A \times \widetilde{S} B$ and $\widetilde{k}: \widetilde{S}(A * B) \rightarrow \widetilde{S A} \# \widetilde{S B}$ making the following diagram commutative.


Furthermore $\widetilde{h}$ and $\widetilde{k}$ are homotopy equivalences provided $A$ and $B$ have the

[^1]homotopy type of $C W$ complexes.
Proof Define $\widetilde{h}$ by means of the following diagrams (the second represents a section with ( $a, b$ ) fixed)


The function $\widetilde{h}$ clearly defines $\widetilde{k}: \widetilde{S}(A \widetilde{*} B) \rightarrow \widetilde{S A} \# \widetilde{S} B$ by taking the quotient. Since $\widetilde{C}_{\widetilde{W}}$ and $\widetilde{S}(A \widetilde{*} B)$ have the obvious quotient topologies from $A \times I \times B \times I, \widetilde{h}$ and $\widetilde{k}$ are continuous and the result follows. These maps are related to those of theorems 2.4 and 2.5 of [3]. Now $\widetilde{h}$ determines a homeomorphism $\widetilde{C_{\widetilde{W}}} \rightarrow \widetilde{S} A \overline{\times} \widetilde{S} B$ where $\widetilde{S A} \overline{\times} \widetilde{S} B$ is the product $\widetilde{S} A \times \widetilde{S} B$ given the quotient topology from $A \times I$ $\times B \times I$. Let $k$ be the functor giving the weak topology with respect to compact
subsets and suppose that $A$ and $B$ are $C W$ complexes, then the composite $k(\widetilde{S} A \times \widetilde{S} B) \rightarrow \widetilde{S} A \overline{\times} \widetilde{S} B \rightarrow \widetilde{S} A \times \widetilde{S} B$ is a homotopy equivalence since $\widetilde{S} A \times \widetilde{S} B$ has the homotopy type of a $C W$ complex (proposition 3 of [7]), and it follows that $\widetilde{S} A \overline{\times} \widetilde{S} B \rightarrow \widetilde{S} A \times \widetilde{S} B$ is a weak homotopy equivalence. Now $A \widetilde{*} B$ has the homotopy type of a $C W$ complex by the following lemma and thus so does $\widetilde{S A} \overline{\times} \widetilde{S} B$ since it has the homotopy type of a cofibre space induced by a cellular map. It follows that $\widetilde{h}$ is a homotopy equivalence and $\widetilde{k}$ is a homotopy equivalence by a similar argument.

Lemma 2.2. Let $A$ and $B$ be $C W$ complexes, then $A \widetilde{*} B$ has the homotopy type of a CW complex.

Proof. The map $A \widetilde{*} B \rightarrow \widetilde{S}(A \times B)$ gives a domination of $A \widetilde{*} B$ by $\widetilde{S}(A \times B)$ and since $\widetilde{S}(A \times B)$ has the homotopy type of a $C W$ complex (proposition 3 of [7]), the lemma follows from results of [12].

Consider now the base point case of the above situation. Clearly $\widetilde{W}$ determines a quotient function $W: A * B \rightarrow S A \vee S B$. Let $h: C_{W} \rightarrow S A \times S B$ and $k: S(A * B)$ $\rightarrow S A \# S B$ also be the quotients of $\widetilde{h}$ and $\widetilde{k}$. Since collapsing a contractible subset of a $C W$ complex is a homotopy equivalence, the following corollary is now proved.

Corollary 2.3 ${ }^{11}$. There are functorial maps $h$ and $k$ making the following diagram commutative.


Furthermore $h$ and $k$ are homotopy equivalences for $A$ and $B$ in $\mathscr{W}$.
3. The generalized James product. In this section we define the generalized James product and prove that it is equivalent to the generalized Samelson product. We assume from here onwards that all maps preserve base points.

Definition. An $M$-space is a space $Y$ with a multiplication $m: Y \times Y \rightarrow Y$

1) c. f. Theorem 4.2 of [1].
having homotopy identity, that is, $m \mid Y \bigvee Y$ is homotopic to the folding map.
Now let $Y$ be an $M$-space and $f: S A \rightarrow Y$ and $g: S B \rightarrow Y$ be maps; then $f . g, g . f: S A \times S B \rightarrow Y$ will denote the products of the two maps $S A \times S B \xrightarrow{p_{1}}$ $S A \xrightarrow{f} Y$ and $S A \times S B \xrightarrow{p_{2}} S B \xrightarrow{g} Y$ using the multiplication in $Y$. Let $H: m i \sim c: Y \vee Y \rightarrow Y$ be a given homotopy and let $L_{1}=c\left(H\left(j_{1} f \# 1\right) \vee H\left(j_{2} g \# 1\right)\right)$ and $L_{2}=c\left(H\left(j_{2} f \# 1\right) \vee H\left(j_{1} g \# 1\right)\right)$ be the maps $(S A \vee S B) \# I \rightarrow Y$ where $j_{1}, j_{2}: Y \rightarrow Y \vee Y$ are the inclusions. Then, denoting track addition in $(A * B) \# I$ by + , it is clear that the maps $(f \cdot g) h+L_{1}(W \# 1)$ and $(g . f) h+L_{2}(W \# 1): C(A \# B)$ $\rightarrow Y$ agree on the base of the cone and thus their difference is defined

$$
d(f . g, g . f)=(f . g) h+L_{1}(W \# 1)-L_{2}(W \# 1)-(g . f) h: S(A * B) \rightarrow Y
$$

as in the following diagram.


Lemma 3.1. The class of $d(f . g, g . f)$ depends only on the classes of $f$ and $g$.

Proof. If $f_{0} \sim f_{1}$ and $g_{0} \sim g_{1}$, then $d\left(f_{t} . g_{t}, g_{t} . f_{t}\right)$ gives a homotopy $d\left(f_{0} . g_{0}, g_{0} . f_{0}\right) \sim d\left(f_{1} . g_{1}, g_{1} . f_{1}\right)$.

Definition. The James product ${ }^{1)}$ is the function $<,>_{J}:[S A, Y] \times[S B, Y]$ $\rightarrow[S(A * B), Y]$ given by $<f, g>_{J}=\{d(f . g, g . f)\}$.

The homotopy $H: m i \sim c: Y \bigvee Y \rightarrow Y$ is used in the above definition, however the construction $<,>_{J}$ is independent of the choice of this homotopy.

Proposition 3.2. $<,>_{J}$ is independent of the homotopy $H: m i \sim c$ :

[^2]$Y \bigvee Y \rightarrow Y$.
Proof. By considering the difference in $[S(A * B), Y]$ of the $d(f . g, g . f)$ for different $H$ 's, it is clearly sufficient to show that the homomorphism $W^{*}$ : $\left.\pi_{1}^{S A \vee S B}(Y ;(f . g) i)\right) \rightarrow \pi_{1}{ }^{A * B}(Y ;(f . g) i W)$ is zero. Since $A * B$ is an $H^{\prime}$-space ${ }^{1) 2)}$, this is equivalent to showing that $\Gamma((f . g) i, W): \pi_{1}^{S A V S B}(Y ; *) \rightarrow \pi_{1}{ }^{4 * \mathrm{~B}}(Y ; *)$ is zero where $\Gamma$ is defined in 3.2 of [9]. However, by the co-primitivity theorem 3.3.3 of [9], $\Gamma((f . g) i, W)=W^{*}$. The result follows since $\pi_{1}^{S A \vee S B}(Y ; *)$ $\cong \pi_{1}^{S A}(Y, *) \oplus \pi_{1}{ }^{S B}(Y, *)$, $W^{*}$ is linear, and the composite functions $A * B$ $\rightarrow S A \bigvee S B \rightarrow S A$ and $A * B \rightarrow S A \bigvee S B \rightarrow S B$ are clearly nulhomotopic.
4. The generalized Samelson products. We now define two Samelson products. We are interested in the case that $Y$ is an $M$-space such that for suitable $K$ the set of homotopy classes $\left[K, Y\right.$ ] is a loop ${ }^{33}$.

Lemma 4.1. (c.f. theorem 1.1 of [5]). Let $K$ belong to $\mathscr{W}$ and $Y$ be a path connected $\left.{ }^{4}\right) M$-space, then $[K, Y]$ is a loop under the multiplication on $Y$.

Consider now the following sequence which is exact for $P$ and $Q$ having non degenerate base points:

$$
\cdots \rightarrow[S(P \times Q), Y] \rightarrow[S(P \vee Q), Y] \rightarrow[P \# Q, Y] \xrightarrow{\pi^{*}}[P \times Q, Y] \rightarrow[P \vee Q, Y] .
$$

Lemma 4.2. Let $P$ and $Q$ have non degenerate base point and $\pi^{*}:[P \# Q, Y]$ $\rightarrow[P \times Q, Y]$ be a homomorphism of loops, then $\pi^{*}$ is injective.

Proof. The proof given here is elementary (c.f. proposition 4 of [2]). The homomorphism $[S(P \times Q), Y] \rightarrow[S(P \vee Q), Y]$ is surjective, hence by exactness the kernel of $\pi^{*}$ is zero. Since a homomorphism of loops is injective if and only if its kernel is zero, the result is immediate.

Now let $P$ and $Q$ have non degenerate base point, and let $Y$ be an $M$-space for which the functions $[P \# Q, Y] \rightarrow[P \times Q, Y] \rightarrow[P \vee Q, Y]$ are homomorphisms of loops: this is true if either $P$ and $Q$ are in $\mathscr{W}$ or if $Y$ has homotopy inverses. Let $f: P \rightarrow Y$ and $g: Q \rightarrow Y$ then $f \cdot g=\left(f p_{1}\right) .\left(g p_{2}\right)$ and $g . f=\left(g p_{2}\right) .\left(f p_{1}\right)$ : $P \times Q \rightarrow Y$ are well defined and $\{f . g\} . r\{g . f\}$ in the loop $[P \times Q, Y]$ depends only

[^3]on the homotopy classes $\{f\}$ and $\{g\}$. Since $i^{*}:[P \times Q, Y] \rightarrow[P \vee Q, Y]$ is linear, $i^{*}(\{f . g\} . r\{g . f\})=\{*\}$, and thus there is a unique $<f, g>_{s_{1}}$ in $[P \# Q, Y]$ with $\pi^{*}<f, g>_{s_{1}}=\{f . g\} . r\{g . f\}$. Similarly there is a unique $<f, g>_{s_{2}}$ in $[P \# Q, Y]$ with $\pi^{*}<f, g>_{s_{2}}=l\{g . f\} .\{f . g\}$.

Definition. The right and left Samelson ${ }^{1)}$ products are the functions ${ }^{2)}$ $<,>_{s_{1}}$ and $<,>_{S_{2}}:[P, Y] \times[Q, Y] \rightarrow[P \# Q, Y]$.
5. The relation between the products. We now prove that, with $P=S A$ and $Q=S B$, the James product $<,>_{\jmath}:[S A, Y] \times[S B, Y] \rightarrow[S(A * B), Y]$ and the Samelson product $<,>_{s_{1}}:[S A, Y] \times[S B, Y] \rightarrow[S A \# S B, Y]$ correspond under the functorial homomorphism $k^{*}:[S A \# S B, Y] \rightarrow[S(A * B), Y]$ when both products are defined: furthermore that if $k^{*}$ is also an isomorphism then the Samelson products $<,>_{S_{1}}$ and $<,>_{S_{2}}$ are equal.

Theorem 5.1. Let $Y$ be an $M$-space, and let the James product $<,>_{J}$ : $[S A, Y] \times[S B, Y] \rightarrow[S(A * B), Y]$, and Samelson product $<,>_{s_{1}}:[S A, Y] \times[S B, Y]$ $\rightarrow[S A \# S B, Y]$ both be defined, then $k^{*}<f, g>_{s_{\mathrm{t}}}=<f, g>_{J}$ under the homomorphism ${ }^{3} k^{*}:[S A \# S B, Y] \rightarrow[S(A * B), Y]^{4]}$. Moreover, when $k^{*}$ is an isomorphism, the two Samelson products $<,>_{s_{1}}$ and $<,>_{s_{1}}$ are equal.

Proof. Let $\mu: C_{W} \rightarrow S(A * B) \vee C_{W}$ denote the coaction. Given any map $\mathrm{q}: S A \times S B \rightarrow Y$, we denote by $\widetilde{\mathrm{q}}$ the composite $C_{W} \xrightarrow{h} S A \times S B \xrightarrow{q} Y$. Also let $M_{i}=L_{i} \cdot(r(\widetilde{g} . \widetilde{f}) j):(S A \vee S B) \# I \rightarrow Y(i=1,2)$. Then, as maps $C_{W} \rightarrow Y$, we have

$$
\begin{aligned}
(\widetilde{f} \cdot \widetilde{g}) \cdot r(\widetilde{g} \cdot \widetilde{f}) \sim & (\widetilde{f} \cdot \widetilde{g}) \cdot r(\widetilde{g} \cdot \widetilde{f})+M_{1}(W \# 1) \sim d\left((\widetilde{f} \cdot \widetilde{g}) \cdot r(\widetilde{g} \cdot \widetilde{f})+M_{1}(W \# 1),(\widetilde{g} \cdot \widetilde{f}) \cdot r(\widetilde{g} \cdot \widetilde{f})\right. \\
& \left.\left.+M_{2}(W \# 1)\right), \quad(\widetilde{g} \cdot \widetilde{f}) \cdot r(\widetilde{g} \cdot \widetilde{f})+M_{2}(W \# 1)\right) \mu
\end{aligned}
$$

and thus, since $(\widetilde{g} \cdot \widetilde{f}) \cdot r(\widetilde{g} \cdot \widetilde{f})+M_{2}(W \# 1) \sim *$, we have

$$
\begin{aligned}
(\widetilde{f} \cdot \widetilde{g}) \cdot r(\widetilde{g} \cdot \widetilde{f}) & \sim d\left((\widetilde{f} \cdot \widetilde{g}) \cdot r(\widetilde{g} \cdot \widetilde{f})+M_{1}(W \# 1),(\widetilde{g} \cdot \widetilde{f}) \cdot r(\widetilde{g} \cdot \widetilde{f})+M_{2}(W \# 1)\right) \circ p \\
& \sim\left(d\left(\widetilde{f} \cdot \widetilde{g}+L_{1}(W \# 1), \widetilde{g} \cdot \widetilde{f}+L_{2}(W \# 1)\right) \cdot d(r(\widetilde{g} \cdot \widetilde{f}), r(\widetilde{g} \cdot \widetilde{f}))\right) \circ p \\
& \sim\left(d\left(\widetilde{f} \cdot \widetilde{g}+L_{1}(W \# 1), \widetilde{g} \cdot \widetilde{f}+L_{2}(W \# 1)\right) \circ p\right.
\end{aligned}
$$

[^4]Consider the exact sequence

$$
[S(S A \vee S B), Y] \xrightarrow{(S W)^{*}}[S(A * B), Y] \xrightarrow{p^{*}}\left[C_{W}, Y\right] .
$$

In the proof of proposition 3.2 we showed $(S W)^{*}=0$, and thus $p^{*}$ is injective since it is a homomorphism of loops having zero kernel. The first part of the theorem now follows. It is clear that by a similar argument to the above, multiplying on the left by $l(\breve{g} . \widetilde{f})$ instead of on the right by $r(\widetilde{g} . \widetilde{f})$, we obtain $k^{*}<f, g>_{s}$ $=<f, g>_{J}$ and the second part of the theorem is immediate.
6. Properties of the products. We now consider the linearity of the James and Samelson products and obtain Jacobi identities for them.

Let $Y$ be an $M$-space, giving group structures to $[P \times Q, Y]$ and $[P \# Q, Y]$ where $P$ and $Q$ have non-degenerate base points. Let ${ }^{c}$ denote the automorphism of $[P \# Q, Y]$ corresponding to the inner automorphism $x \rightarrow c+x-c$ of $[P \times Q, Y]$. The following relations are elementary from corresponding relations between commutators:

$$
\begin{aligned}
& <a a^{\prime}, b>_{s_{1}}=<a^{\prime}, b>_{s_{1}}^{a}+<a, b>_{s_{1}}, \\
& <a, b b^{\prime}>_{s_{1}}=<a, b>_{s_{1}}+<a, b^{\prime}>_{s_{1}}^{b} .
\end{aligned}
$$

We now give conditions ensuring the linearity of the James and Samelson products in each of their variables.

THEOREM 6.1. Let $P$ and $Q$ have non-degenerate base points and let $Y$ have an $M$ structure inducing group structures ${ }^{1)}$ on $[P \times Q, Y]$ and $[P \# Q, Y]$, then the product $<,>_{s_{1}}:[P, Y] \times[Q, Y] \rightarrow[P \# Q, Y]$ satisfies $<a a^{\prime}, b>_{s_{1}}$ $=<a, b\rangle_{s_{1}}+\left\langle a^{\prime}, b\right\rangle_{s_{1}}$ if $P$ has a comultiplication with homotopy identity and satisfies $\left.\left.<a, b b^{\prime}\right\rangle_{s_{1}}=\langle a, b\rangle_{s_{1}}+<a, b^{\prime}\right\rangle_{s_{1}}$ if $Q$ has a comultiplication with homotopy identity.

Proof. The comultiplication on $P$ induces comultiplications on $P \times Q / * \times Q$ and $P \# Q$ with homotopy identity. Thus $[P \times Q / * \times Q, Y]$ and $[P \# Q, Y]$ are abelian. From the exact sequence $[Q, Y] \leftarrow[P \times Q, Y] \leftarrow[P \times Q / * \times Q, Y]$ it follows that $\left[a^{\prime}, b\right]$ and $a$ both lie in the image of $[P \times Q / * \times Q, Y]$ and hence commute. The proof is now clear.

[^5]Corollary 6.2. Let $A$ and $B$ be in $\mathscr{W}$ and let $Y$ be a homotopy associative $M$-space, then the James product $<,>_{J}:[S A, Y] \times[S B, Y]$ $\rightarrow[S(A * B), Y]$ is bilinear.

Given that $Y$ is a homotopy associative $M$-space and $P, Q$ and $R$ are in $\mathscr{W}$, then the Samelson product $<,>_{s_{1}}$ satisfies a general Jacobi identity

$$
\tau_{1} \ll-q, p>, r>^{q}+\tau_{2} \ll-r, q>, p>^{r}+\tau_{3} \ll-p, r>, q>^{p}=0
$$

where $\tau_{1}, \tau_{2}$ and $\tau_{3}$ are the obvious twisting functions (c.f. §2 of [8]). The following special case is obtained as in theorem 1 of [8].

Theorem 6.3. (The Jacobi identity) Let $P, Q$ and $R$ be in $\mathscr{W}$ and have comultiplications with homotopy identity and let $Y$ be a homotopy associative $M$-space, then in the group $[P \# Q \# R, Y]$, the Samelson product satisfies

$$
\ll p, q>, r>+\tau_{1} \ll r, p>, q>+\tau_{2} \ll q, r>, p>=0
$$

where $\tau_{1}$ and $\tau_{2}$ are the obvious twisting functions.

Corollary 6.4. If $A, B$ and $C$ are in $\mathscr{W}$ and $Y$ is a homotopy associative $M$-space, then the James product satisfies the Jacobi identity.

## References

[1] M. Arkowitz, The generalized Whitehead product, Pacific J. Math., 12(1962), 7-23.
[2] M. Arkowitz, Homotopy products for $H$-spaces, Michigan Math. J., 10(1963), 1-9.
[3] D. E. Cohen, Products in carrier theory, Proc. London Math. Soc., 7(1957), 219-248.
[4] I. M. James, On spaces with a multiplication, Pacific J. Math., 7(1957), 1083-1100.
[ 5 ] I. M. James, On $H$-spaces and their homotopy groups, Quart. J. Math. Oxford, 11(1960), 161-179.
[6] G. S. Mccarty, Products between homotopy groups and the $J$-morphism, Quart. J. Math. Oxford, (2) 15(1964), 362-70.
[7] J. Milnor, On spaces having the homotopy type of a $C W$-complex, Trans. Amer. Math. Soc., 90, (1959), 272-280.
[8] J. W. RUTTER, Two theorems on Whitehead products, J. Lond. Math. Soc., 43(1968), 509-512 ; Correction to two theorems on Whitehead products, J. London Math. Soc., (2) 1 (1969), 20.
[9] J. W. RuTter, A homotopy classification of maps into an induced fibre space, Topology, 6(1967), 379-403.
[10] H. Samelson, A connection between the Whitehead and the Pontryagin product, Amer. J. Math., 75(1953), 744-752.
[11] K. Tsuchida, Generalised James product and Hopf construction, Tôhoku Math. J., 17(1965), 319-334.
[12] J. H. C. Whitehead, Combinatorial homotopy I, Bull. Amer. Math. Soc., 55(1949), 213-245.

Department of Pure Mathematics
The University of Liverpool
Liverpool, England

Department of Mathematics
The University of Hong Kong
Hong Kong


[^0]:    1) Our definition of Whitehead product corresponds to taking the commutator $x+y-x-y$ as in [8], whereas the definition in [1] corresponds to the commutator $-x-y+x+y$ (see 2.2 of [1]).
[^1]:    1) These maps are homeomorphisms if $\widetilde{S} A \times \widetilde{S} B$ and $\breve{S} A \# \widetilde{S} B$ are given the quotient topology from $A \times I \times B \times I$ : this, of course, is the weak topology if $A$ and $B$ are $C W$ complexes.
[^2]:    1) A similar product is defined by K . Tsuchida in $\S 4$ of [11] in case $Y$ has strict identity and all spaces are path connected countable CW complexes. However it differs from ours by involutions because of our different conventions for commutators.
[^3]:    1) An $H^{\prime}$-space has a homotopy associative comultiplication with homotopy identity and homotopy inverses.
    2) e.g. it is dominated by $S(A \times B)$ : there is in fact a simply defined comultiplication.
    3) A set having a binary structure with two sided identity and unique solutions $x$ and $y$ for $x a=b$ and $a y=b$.
    4) Or more generally let the $M$-structure induce a loop structure on the path components of $Y$.
[^4]:    1) After the product defined in [10].
    2) In case $[P \times Q, Y]$ is a group, these products differ from one another only by the obvious involutions.
    3) If $A$ and $B$ are in ' $\mathcal{T}^{\prime}$, then both products are defined and $k^{*}$ is an isomorphism.
    4) In case $A$ and $B$ are spheres and $Y$ has strict identity, the first part of this theorem is similar to proposition 1.3 of [6].
[^5]:    1) e.g. if $Y$ is homotopy associative and $P$ and $Q$ belong to $\mathscr{W}$, or if $Y$ is homotopy associative with homotopy inverses.
