

Xianfu Wang\*, Department of Mathematics and Statistics, Okanagan  
University College, Kelowna, B.C. V1V 1V7, Canada.  
email: xwang@ouc.bc.ca

## ARE CONE-MONOTONE FUNCTIONS GENERICALLY INTERMEDIATELY DIFFERENTIABLE?

### Abstract

On a separable Banach space, we show that a cone-monotone function is generically intermediate differentiable provided its Dini-derivatives are finite along every direction and the cone has nonempty interior.

### 1 Introduction

Let  $X$  be a Banach space with dual space  $X^*$ , let  $A \subset X$  be a non-empty open set, and let  $K \subset X$  be a closed convex cone with  $\text{int}(K) \neq \emptyset$ . The open ball with center  $x$  and radius  $r$  is denoted by  $B_r(x)$ . We say that  $f : A \rightarrow \mathbb{R} \cup \{+\infty\}$  is  $K$ -increasing on a set  $A$  if  $f(x+k) \geq f(x)$  whenever  $x \in A, x+k \in A$  for  $k \in K$ . The *upper Dini derivative* of  $f$  at  $x \in A$  in the direction  $v$  is defined by

$$f^+(x; v) := \limsup_{t \downarrow 0} \frac{f(x + tv) - f(x)}{t},$$

and the *lower Dini derivative* of  $f$  at  $x \in A$  in the direction  $v$  by

$$f_+(x; v) := \liminf_{t \downarrow 0} \frac{f(x + tv) - f(x)}{t}.$$

---

Key Words: Separable Banach space, cone-monotone function, pointwise Lipschitz function, intermediate derivative

Mathematical Reviews subject classification: 46G05

Received by the editors July 22, 2003

Communicated by: B. S. Thomson

\*Research supported by the Natural Sciences and Engineering Research Council of Canada and by Grant-In-Aid of OUC.

We observe that both  $f_+(x; \cdot)$  and  $f^+(x; \cdot)$  are  $K$ -monotone whenever  $f$  is. Following [4] we say that  $f$  is *intermediately differentiable* at  $x$  if there exists a continuous linear functional  $x^*$  on  $X$  such that

$$f_+(x; v) \leq \langle x^*, v \rangle \leq f^+(x; v) \text{ for every } v \in X.$$

This is the same as, there exists  $x^* \in X^*$  such that for every  $v \in X$  there exists  $t_n \downarrow 0$  with

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{f(x + t_n v) - f(x)}{t_n} = \langle x^*, v \rangle.$$

Fabian and Preiss [4] showed that for a large class of Banach spaces which includes the Asplund spaces, a locally Lipschitz function on an open subset of such a space is intermediately differentiable on a residual subset of its domain. It is our goal in this note to show that under mild assumptions, when  $X$  is separable, this also holds for cone-monotone functions.

## 2 Main Results

We begin with an observation on upper and lower Dini derivatives.

**Lemma 1.** *Let  $f : X \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$  be  $K$ -increasing. Fix  $x \in X$  and  $e \in \text{int}(K)$ .*

- (i) *If  $f^+(x; e) < +\infty$ , then  $f^+(x; v) < +\infty$  for every  $v \in X$ . Therefore, if  $f^+(x; v) = +\infty$  for some  $v \in X$ , then  $f^+(x; k) = +\infty$  for every  $k \in \text{int}(K)$ .*
- (ii) *If  $f_+(x; -e) > -\infty$ , then  $f_+(x; v) > -\infty$  for every  $v \in X$ . Therefore, if  $f_+(x; v) = -\infty$  for some  $v \in X$ , then  $f_+(x; -k) = -\infty$  for every  $k \in \text{int}(K)$ .*

PROOF. (i) Assume  $f^+(x; v) = +\infty$  for some  $v$ . Because  $e \in \text{int}(K)$ , there exists  $\epsilon > 0$  such that  $e + B_\epsilon(0) \subset K$ . We have

$$f^+(x; \epsilon \frac{v}{\|v\|}) \leq f^+(x; e);$$

so  $f^+(x; e) = +\infty$ . This contradicts the assumption.

(ii) Assume  $f_+(x; v) = -\infty$  for some  $v$ . Since  $e \in \text{int}(K)$ , there exists  $\epsilon > 0$  such that

$$f_+(x; -\epsilon \frac{v}{\|v\|}) \geq f_+(x; -e),$$

so  $f_+(x; -e) = -\infty$ . This contradicts the assumption.  $\square$

Now we can formulate our result.

**Theorem 1.** *Let  $X$  be a separable Banach space and  $K \subset X$  be a closed convex cone with non-empty interior. Suppose that  $f : X \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$  is continuous and  $K$ -increasing. If there exists  $e \in \text{int}(K)$  such that  $f^+(x; e) < \infty$  and  $f_+(x; -e) > -\infty$  for every  $x \in X$ , then  $f$  is generically intermediately differentiable on  $X$ .*

PROOF. Choose a countable dense set  $\{k_i\}_{i=1}^\infty$  from  $\text{int}(K)$ . For latter convenience, we let  $k_1 = e$ . Write

$$Y_p = \text{span}\{k_1, \dots, k_p\}, \text{ and } B_{Y_p} := \left\{ \sum_{i=1}^p l_i k_i : |l_i| \leq 2 \text{ for } 1 \leq i \leq p \right\}.$$

(a): **Finding intermediate derivatives on a finite dimensional space.**

Define  $O_n :=$

$$\left\{ x \in X \mid \sup_{v \in B_{Y_p}} \left| \frac{f(x + t_x v) - f(x)}{t_x} - \langle x^*, v \rangle \right| < \frac{1}{n} \text{ for some } t_x > 0 \right. \\ \left. \text{and } x^* \in X^* \right\}.$$

Because  $f$  is continuous and  $B_{Y_p}$  is compact,  $O_n$  is open. Indeed, let  $x \in O_n$ . There exists  $\epsilon > 0$  such that  $B_\epsilon(x) \subset O_n$ . Suppose not. Then there exists  $x_m \rightarrow x$  such that for every  $m$  there exists  $v_m \in B_{Y_p}$  such that

$$\left| \frac{f(x_m + t_x v_m) - f(x_m)}{t_x} - \langle x^*, v_m \rangle \right| \geq \frac{1}{n}.$$

Because  $B_{Y_p}$  is compact, there exists a subsequence of  $(v_m)_{m \in \mathbb{N}}$ , without re-labeling, say  $v_m \rightarrow v \in B_{Y_p}$ . Taking the limit, we have

$$\left| \frac{f(x + t_x v) - f(x)}{t_x} - \langle x^*, v \rangle \right| \geq \frac{1}{n}.$$

This contradicts the choice of  $x$ .

Borwein, Burke, and Lewis [2] show that when  $f$  is  $K$ -monotone,  $f$  is Gâteaux differentiable almost everywhere on  $X$ . This shows that  $O_n$  is dense in  $X$ . It follows that  $G_p := \bigcap \{O_n \mid n \in \mathbb{N}\}$ , is a dense  $G_\delta$  in  $X$ . Let  $x \in G_p$ . We will show that  $f$  is intermediately differentiable at  $x$ . As  $x \in G_p$ , for every  $n$ , there exists  $t_n > 0$  such that

$$\left| \frac{f(x + t_n v) - f(x)}{t_n} - \langle x_n^*, v \rangle \right| < \frac{1}{n} \text{ whenever } v \in B_{Y_p}. \quad (1)$$

For fixed  $v$ , we have

$$-\frac{1}{n} + \frac{f(x + t_n v) - f(x)}{t_n} \leq \langle x_n^*, v \rangle \leq \frac{1}{n} + \frac{f(x + t_n v) - f(x)}{t_n}.$$

So by Lemma 1

$$-\infty < f_+(x; v) \leq \liminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} \langle x_n^*, v \rangle \leq \limsup_{n \rightarrow \infty} \langle x_n^*, v \rangle \leq f^+(x; v) < \infty. \quad (2)$$

Let  $\mathbb{Q}$  denote rational numbers. Let

$$D_p := \left\{ \sum_{i=1}^p r_i k_i \mid r_i \in \mathbb{Q}, |r_i| \leq 1 \right\}.$$

Since  $D_p$  is countable, we write  $D_p := \{d_1, d_2, \dots\}$ . For  $d_1$ , by (2) we may take a subsequence of  $(\langle x_n^*, d_1 \rangle)_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  such that  $\langle x_{n1}^*, d_1 \rangle$  converges as  $n1 \rightarrow \infty$ ; For  $d_2$ , by (2) we may take a subsequence of  $(\langle x_{n1}^*, d_2 \rangle)_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  such that  $\langle x_{n2}^*, d_2 \rangle$  converges as  $n2 \rightarrow \infty$ . Continuing in this way, we obtain  $(x_{nn}^*)_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  such that for every  $d_k$  we have

$$\langle x_{nn}^*, d_k \rangle \text{ converges as } nn \rightarrow \infty. \quad (3)$$

Associated with  $(x_{nn}^*)_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  are  $t_{nn} \downarrow 0$  which verifies

$$\left| \frac{f(x + t_{nn}v) - f(x)}{t_{nn}} - \langle x_{nn}^*, v \rangle \right| < \frac{1}{nn} \text{ for all } v \in B_{Y_p}.$$

For every  $v \in X$  we let

$$g(v) := \limsup_{nn \rightarrow \infty} \frac{f(x + t_{nn}v) - f(x)}{t_{nn}}.$$

Clearly,  $f_+(x; v) \leq g(v) \leq f^+(x; v)$  for all  $v \in X$ . We proceed to show that  $g$  is linear on  $Y_p$ .

Now for every  $d_k \in D_p$ , by (3)

$$g(d_k) = \limsup_{nn \rightarrow \infty} \frac{f(x + t_{nn}d_k) - f(x)}{t_{nn}} = \lim_{nn \rightarrow \infty} \langle x_{nn}^*, d_k \rangle.$$

From (1), when  $r_i \in \mathbb{Q}$  and  $|r_i| \leq 1$  we have

$$\begin{aligned} \left| \frac{f(x + t_{nn} \sum_{i=1}^p r_i k_i) - f(x)}{t_{nn}} - \langle x_{nn}^*, \sum_{i=1}^p r_i k_i \rangle \right| &< \frac{1}{nn}, \\ \left| \frac{f(x + t_{nn}(-k_i)) - f(x)}{t_{nn}} - \langle x_{nn}^*, (-k_i) \rangle \right| &< \frac{1}{nn}, \end{aligned}$$

and

$$\left| \frac{f(x + t_{nn}(-\sum_{i=1}^p r_i k_i)) - f(x)}{t_{nn}} - \langle x_{nn}^*, -\sum_{i=1}^p r_i k_i \rangle \right| < \frac{1}{nn}.$$

As  $nn \rightarrow \infty$ , we obtain

$$g\left(\sum_{i=1}^p r_i k_i\right) = \sum_{i=1}^p r_i g(k_i), \quad (4)$$

whenever  $r_i \in \mathbb{Q}$  and  $|r_i| \leq 1$ . Because  $g$  is  $K$ -increasing and  $K$  is a convex cone, for each  $l_1, l_2, \dots, l_p$  we can find rationals  $\hat{l}_1 \geq l_1, \dots, \hat{l}_p \geq l_p$  such that

$$g\left(\sum_{i=1}^p l_i k_i\right) \leq g\left(\sum_{i=1}^p \hat{l}_i k_i\right) = \sum_{i=1}^p \hat{l}_i g(k_i),$$

where the equality follows from (4). Letting  $\hat{l}_1 \rightarrow l_1, \dots, \hat{l}_p \rightarrow l_p$ , we obtain

$$g\left(\sum_{i=1}^p l_i k_i\right) \leq \sum_{i=1}^p l_i g(k_i).$$

Similarly, we have  $g\left(\sum_{i=1}^p l_i k_i\right) \geq \sum_{i=1}^p l_i g(k_i)$ . Hence

$$g\left(\sum_{i=1}^p l_i k_i\right) = \sum_{i=1}^p l_i g(k_i),$$

when  $|l_i| \leq 1$  for  $1 \leq i \leq p$ . Because  $g$  is positive homogeneous,  $g$  is linear on  $Y_p$ .

(b): **From finite dimensional spaces to a dense linear span.**

Write  $Y = \bigcup_{p=1}^{\infty} Y_p$ . Because  $\{k_i\}_{i=1}^{\infty}$  is dense in  $K$ , and  $X = K - K$ ,  $Y$  is dense in  $X$ . For each  $Y_p$ , by (a) there exists  $G_p$ , a dense  $G_{\delta}$  subset of  $X$ , such that for every  $x \in G_p$  there exists  $g : X \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$  satisfying

- (i)  $g$  is linear on  $Y_p$ ;
- (ii)  $g$  is  $K$ -increasing on  $X$  and  $g(v) \leq f^+(x; e)$  for  $v \leq_K e$  with  $v \in X$ ;
- (iii)  $f_+(x; v) \leq g(v) \leq f^+(x; v)$  for  $v \in X$ .

Let  $G := \bigcap_{p=1}^{\infty} G_p$  and  $x \in G$ . By (ii), there exists  $g : X \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$  satisfying (i), (ii), and (iii) such that  $\langle g, y \rangle \leq \langle g, e \rangle \leq f^+(x; e)$ , when  $y \leq_K e$  and  $y \in Y_p$ . (Note here that we use  $\langle g, y \rangle$  because  $g$  is linear on  $Y_p$ .) Because  $e \in \text{int}(K)$ , there exists a  $\alpha > 0$  such that  $B_\alpha(0) \subset \{y \in X : y \leq_K e\}$ . Therefore,

$$\langle g, y \rangle \leq \frac{f^+(x; e)}{\alpha} \|y\| \text{ for } y \in Y_p.$$

By the Hahn-Banach theorem, there exists  $x^* \in X^*$  such that  $x^*|_{Y_p} = g|_{Y_p}$  and  $\langle x^*, y \rangle \leq \frac{f^+(x; e)}{\alpha} \|y\|$ , for  $y \in X$ . Set

$$C_p := \left\{ x^* \in X^* \mid f_+(x; v) \leq \langle x^*, v \rangle \leq f^+(x; v) \text{ for } v \in Y_p, \|x^*\| \leq \frac{f^+(x; e)}{\alpha} \right\}.$$

Then  $C_p$  is weak\* closed and bounded, so weak\* compact. By (a) we have  $\{C_p : p \in \mathbb{N}\}$  has finite intersection property. Indeed, for any finite number of finite dimensional subspaces  $Y_{p_1}, \dots, Y_{p_k}$ , there exists  $p$  large such that

$$Y_{p_1} \cup Y_{p_2} \cup \dots \cup Y_{p_k} \subset Y_p.$$

Since  $x \in G_p$ , we know  $C_p \subset \bigcap_{i=1}^k C_{p_i}$ . It follows that  $C := \bigcap_{p=1}^{\infty} C_p \neq \emptyset$ . For  $x^* \in C$ , we have

$$f_+(x; y) \leq \langle x^*, y \rangle \leq f^+(x; y) \text{ for every } y \in Y.$$

(c): **From dense linear space to the separable space.**

From (b), for  $x \in G$ , there exists  $x^* \in X^*$  such that

$$f_+(x; y) \leq \langle x^*, y \rangle \leq f^+(x; y) \text{ for every } y \in Y, \quad (5)$$

where  $Y$  is dense in  $X$ . For every  $v \in X$ ,  $v + \text{int}(K)$  and  $v - \text{int}(K)$  are open. Because  $Y$  is dense in  $X$ , there exist  $y_n, z_n \in Y$  arbitrary nearby  $v$  such that  $y_n \in v - \text{int}(K)$  and  $z_n \in v + \text{int}(K)$ . That is, we can find  $y_n, z_n \in Y$  such that  $y_n \leq_K v \leq_K z_n$ , while  $y_n \rightarrow v$  and  $z_n \rightarrow v$  in norm. Now by (5),

$$\begin{aligned} \langle x^*, y_n \rangle &\leq f^+(x; y_n) \leq f^+(x; v), \text{ and} \\ \langle x^*, z_n \rangle &\geq f_+(x; z_n) \geq f_+(x; v). \end{aligned}$$

Letting  $n \rightarrow \infty$ , we obtain  $f_+(x; v) \leq \langle x^*, v \rangle \leq f^+(x; v)$ . Therefore,  $x^*$  is an intermediate derivative of  $f$  at  $x \in G$ .  $\square$

Recall that a function  $f : X \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$  is *quasiconvex* if the lower level sets  $S_\lambda(f) = \{x \in A \mid f(x) \leq \lambda\}$  is convex for every  $\lambda \in \mathbb{R}$ . We need the following fact from [1].

**Lemma 2.** *Assume  $f$  is quasiconvex and lower semicontinuous (l.s.c.) on a Banach space  $X$ . Suppose that  $S_\lambda$  has non-empty interior. Then for every  $a$  with  $f(a) > \lambda$ , there exist an open neighborhood  $V$  of  $a$  and a convex cone  $K$  with non-empty interior, such that  $f$  is  $K$ -monotone on  $V$ .*

**Corollary 1.** *Let  $X$  be a separable Banach space. Suppose that  $f : X \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$  is continuous, quasiconvex, and  $f_+(x; v) > -\infty$ ,  $f^+(x; v) < +\infty$  for all  $x, v \in X$ . Then  $f$  is intermediately differentiable generically on  $X$ .*

PROOF. Consider  $\bar{\lambda}$  such that whenever  $\mu < \bar{\lambda} < \lambda$ , the set  $S_\mu(f)$  has no interior and  $S_\lambda(f)$  has interior. Define

$$A := \{x \in X \mid f(x) < \bar{\lambda}\}, \quad B := \{x \in X \mid f(x) = \bar{\lambda}\}, \\ C := \{x \in X \mid f(x) \leq \bar{\lambda}\}.$$

The set  $A = \bigcup_{n=1}^{\infty} A_n$  with  $A_n := \{x \in X \mid f(x) \leq \bar{\lambda} - 1/n\}$ . Since  $A_n$  has no interior and closed,  $A$  is of first category.  $\text{bdry}(B)$  is also nowhere dense. For each  $x \in (X \setminus C)$ , by Lemma 2, there exists a neighborhood  $U_x$  of  $x$  such that  $f$  is  $K$ -monotone on  $U_x$  for some closed convex cone  $K$  with  $\text{int}(K) \neq \emptyset$ . By Theorem 1,  $f$  is intermediate differentiable generically on  $U_x$ . Since  $X$  is separable,  $f$  is generically intermediate differentiable on  $X \setminus C$ .  $\square$

A function  $f : X \rightarrow \mathbb{R} \cup \{+\infty\}$  is called *directionally Lipschitz* at  $x$  in the direction  $u \in X$  if there exists  $\epsilon > 0$  such that when  $\|z - x\| < \epsilon$ ,  $\|h - u\| < \epsilon$ ,  $0 < t < \epsilon$ , one has

$$\frac{f(z + th) - f(z)}{t} < M.$$

In particular,  $f^+(z; h) < M$  when  $\|z - x\| < \epsilon$ ,  $\|h - u\| < \epsilon$ . Borwein, Burke, Lewis [2] show that if  $f$  is directionally Lipschitz at  $x$ , then there exists a neighborhood  $U_x$  of  $x$ , a continuous linear functional  $\phi \in X^*$ , and a closed convex cone  $K$  with  $\text{int}(K) \neq \emptyset$  such that  $f + \phi$  is  $K$ -monotone on  $U_x$ . Therefore, we can apply Theorem 1 to  $f + \phi$  on  $U_x$  provided that  $f_+(z, v) > -\infty$  and  $f^+(z; v) < +\infty$  for  $z \in U_x$  and  $v \in X$ . With this in mind, we have the following consequence.

**Corollary 2.** *Let  $X$  be a separable Banach space,  $A \subset X$  be nonempty open. If  $f$  is continuous, directionally Lipschitz at every point of  $A$ , and  $f_+(x; v) > -\infty$ ,  $f^+(x; v) < \infty$  for  $x \in A$  and  $v \in X$ , then  $f$  is generically intermediate differentiable on  $A$ .*

We remark that Theorem 1 concerns finite intermediate derivatives. If we remove the finiteness of Dini derivatives, the result may fail. This is illustrated by the following modified example from [3, page 288].

**Example 1.** Let  $E$  be a dense  $G_\delta$  subset in  $[0, 1]$  with Lebesgue measure 0. There exists a continuous, strictly increasing function  $f : [0, 1] \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$  such that  $f'(x) = +\infty$  for every  $x \in E$ . The points at which  $f$  has finite intermediate derivative must lie in  $[0, 1] \setminus E$ , which is of first category.

### 3 Appendix

We say that  $f : X \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$  is Lipschitz at  $x$  if

$$L(x) := \limsup_{y \rightarrow x} \frac{|f(y) - f(x)|}{\|y - x\|},$$

is finite. Prof. D. Preiss informed me of the following.

**Lemma 3.** *Let  $X$  be an arbitrary Banach space. Assume that  $f : X \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$  is pointwise Lipschitz on  $X$ ; that is,  $L(x) < +\infty$  for every  $x \in X$ . Then there exists a dense open set  $O$  of  $X$  such that  $f$  is locally Lipschitz on  $O$ .*

PROOF. Define

$$g_n(x) := \sup_{0 < \|y - x\| < 1/n} \frac{|f(y) - f(x)|}{\|y - x\|}.$$

Then  $L(x) = \inf_{n \geq 1} g_n(x)$  for every  $x \in X$ . Since  $g_n$  is lower semicontinuous on  $X$ , there exists a dense  $G_\delta$  set  $D_n$  of  $X$  such that  $g_n$  is continuous at every point of  $x \in D_n$ . Define  $D = \bigcap_{n=1}^{\infty} D_n$ . Then  $D$  is dense  $G_\delta$  in  $X$ . At every  $x \in D$ ,  $L$  is upper semicontinuous. To see this, for  $\epsilon > 0$ , there exists  $g_N$  such that  $g_N(x) < L(x) + \epsilon$ . Since  $g_N$  is continuous at  $x$ , there exists an open neighborhood  $U_x$  of  $x$  such that  $g_N(y) < L(x) + \epsilon$ . Since  $L \leq g_N$ , we have  $L(y) < L(x) + \epsilon$  for  $y \in U_x$ . One can take  $U_x$  to be convex. For every  $y_1, y_2 \in U_x$ ,  $[y_1, y_2] \subset U_x$ . By compactness, we have

$$|f(y_2) - f(y_1)| \leq (L(x) + \epsilon)\|y_2 - y_1\|.$$

Hence  $f$  is Lipschitz on  $U_x$ . It follows that the set

$$O := \{x \in X \mid \exists \text{ an open set } U_x \text{ containing } x \text{ such that } f \text{ is Lipschitz on } U_x\}$$

is open and  $D \subset O$ . Thus,  $O$  is the required dense and open subset.  $\square$

**Lemma 4.** *Let  $X$  be a finite dimensional Banach space and suppose that  $f : X \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$  is  $K$ -increasing with  $\text{int}(K) \neq \emptyset$ . Then the following are equivalent:*

- (a) *At  $x \in X$ ,  $f_+(x; v) > -\infty$  and  $f^+(x; v) < +\infty$  for every  $v \in X$ .*



(b)  $f$  is Lipschitz at point  $x$ .

PROOF. It suffices to show (a) $\Rightarrow$ (b). Suppose (b) does not hold. That is, there exists  $y_n \rightarrow x$  such that

$$\limsup_{y_n \rightarrow x} \frac{|f(y_n) - f(x)|}{\|y_n - x\|} = \infty.$$

Without relabeling, let us assume

$$\lim_{y_n \rightarrow x} \frac{f(y_n) - f(x)}{\|y_n - x\|} = +\infty.$$

The other case is similar. Write  $y_n = x + t_n v_n$  with  $t_n = \|y_n - x\|$  and  $v_n = (y_n - x)/t_n$ . As  $X$  is finite dimensional, there exists a subsequence of  $(v_n)_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  converging. Without relabeling we assume  $v_n \rightarrow v$ . We have

$$\limsup_{t_n \downarrow 0, v_n \rightarrow v} \frac{f(x + t_n v_n) - f(x)}{t_n} = +\infty.$$

Take  $e \in \text{int}(K)$ . For  $n$  sufficiently large,  $(v - v_n) + e \in \text{int}(K)$ . Since  $f$  is  $K$ -increasing, we have

$$\frac{f(x + t_n v_n) - f(x)}{t_n} \leq \frac{f(x + t_n(v + e)) - f(x)}{t_n}.$$

Taking limsup gives  $f^+(x; v + e) = +\infty$ . This contradicts (a).  $\square$

These two lemmas show that Theorem 1 can be deduced from the results for Lipschitz functions [4, 5] when  $X$  is finite dimensional. Nevertheless, when  $X$  is infinite dimensional, it is not clear whether Lemma 4 holds.

Following [5] we say that a function  $f : X \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$  is said to be *uniformly intermediately differentiable* at  $x$  if there exists a continuous linear functional  $x^*$  on  $X$  and a sequence  $t_n \downarrow 0$  such that

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{f(x + t_n v) - f(x)}{t_n} = \langle x^*, v \rangle, \text{ for all } v \in X, \|v\| = 1.$$

Here ‘uniformly’ means that the same sequence is used for all  $v \in X$ ,  $\|v\| = 1$ . Using Lemma 3 and Preiss’ Differentiability Theorem, we can follow Giles and Sciffer’s arguments in the proof of Theorem 1.4 to obtain the final result.

**Theorem 2.** *A pointwise Lipschitz function  $f$  on an open subset  $A$  of an Asplund space  $X$  is uniformly intermediately differentiable on a dense  $G_\delta$  subset of  $A$ .*

This refines Theorem 1.4 of Giles and Sciffer [5].

**Acknowledgments.** I wish to thank Prof. M. Fabian for his helpful conversations.

## References

- [1] J. M. Borwein, X. Wang, *Cone monotone functions: differentiability and continuity*, Canadian Journal of Mathematics, submitted, available as Preprint 2003:209 at <http://www.cecm.sfu.ca/Preprints03/preprints03.html>.
- [2] J. M. Borwein, J. V. Burke, and A. S. Lewis, *Differentiability of cone-monotone functions on separable spaces*, Proc. Amer. Math. Soc., to appear.
- [3] A. M. Bruckner, J. B. Bruckner, and B. S. Thomson, *Real Analysis*, Prentice-Hall, 1997.
- [4] M. Fabian and D. Preiss, *On intermediate differentiability of Lipschitz functions on certain Banach spaces*, Proc. Amer. Math. Soc., **113** (1991), 733–740.
- [5] J. R. Giles and S. Sciffer, *Generalizing generic differentiability properties from convex to locally Lipschitz functions*, J. Math. Anal. Appl., **188** (1994), 833–854.
- [6] L. Zajicek, *A note on intermediate differentiability of Lipschitz functions*, Comment. Math. Univ. Caroline, **40** (1999), 795–799.