# A NOTE ON UNCOUNTABLY MANY DISKS 

Joseph Martin

R. H. Bing has shown [2] that $E^{3}$ (Euclidean three dimensional space) does not contain uncountably many mutually disjoint wild 2spheres. J. R. Stallings has given an example [6] to show that $E^{3}$ does contain uncountably many mutually disjoint wild disks. It is the goal of this note to show that $E^{3}$ does not contain uncountably many mutually disjoint disks each of which fails to lie on a 2 -sphere in $E^{3}$. (A disk which fails to lie on a 2 -sphere is necessarily wild.) For definitions the reader is referred to [1].

Theorem 1. If $V$ is an uncountable collection of mutually disjoint disks in $E^{3}$ then there exists a disk $D$ of the collection $V$ such that $D$ lies on a 2-sphere in $E^{3}$.

The proof of Theorem 1 follows immediately from the following three lemmas.

Lemma 1. If $V$ is an uncountable collection of mutually disjoint disks in $E^{3}$ then there exists an uncountable subcollection $V^{*}$ of $V$ such that if $D$ belongs to $V^{*}, x$ is an interior point of $D$, ax is an arc intersecting $D$ only in the point $x$, and $\varepsilon$ is a positive number then there exists an uncountable subcollection $V_{1}$ of $V^{*}$ such that if $D_{1}$ is an element of $V_{1}$ then (i) $D_{1} \cap a x \neq \phi$ and (ii) there is a homeomorphism of $D_{1}$ onto $D$ which moves no point more than $\varepsilon$.

Proof. Let $V$ be an uncountable collection of mutually disjoint disks in $E^{3}$. Let $V^{\prime}$ denote the subcollection of $V$ defined as follows: $D$ is an element of $V^{\prime}$ if and only if there exist a point $x$ of Int $D$, an arc $a x$ intersecting $D$ only in $x$, and a positive number $\varepsilon$ such that there is no uncountable subcollection $V_{1}$ of $V$ such that if $D_{1}$ belongs to $V_{1}$ then (i) $D_{1} \cap a x \neq \phi$ and (ii) there is a homeomorphism of $D_{1}$ onto $D$ which moves no point more than $\varepsilon$.

It is clear that in order to establish Lemma 1 it is sufficient to show that the collection $V^{\prime}$ is countable. Suppose that $V^{\prime}$ is uncountable.

For each element $D_{\alpha}$ of $V^{\prime}$ let an arc $a_{\infty}$ and a positive number $\varepsilon_{\alpha}$ be chosen such that (i) the common part of $D_{\alpha}$ and $a_{a}$ is an endpoint of $a_{\alpha}$ which is on the interior of $D_{\alpha}$, and (ii) $a_{\infty}$ intersects only a countable number of elements $D$ of $V$ such that there is a homeomorphism of $D$ onto $D_{\alpha}$ which moves no point by more than $\varepsilon_{\alpha}$.

[^0]Let $\varepsilon$ be a positive number and $V^{\prime \prime}$ be an uncountable subcollection of $V^{\prime}$ such that if $D_{\alpha}$ is an element of $V^{\prime \prime}$ then $\varepsilon<\varepsilon_{\alpha}$.

Let $E$ be a disk and $v$ be an arc such that the common part of $E$ and $v$ is an endpoint of $v$ which is on the interior of $E$. For each element $D_{\alpha}$ of $V^{\prime \prime}$ let $h_{\alpha}$ be a homeomorphism of $E \cup v$ onto $D_{\alpha} \cup a_{\alpha}$. Now $\left\{h_{\alpha} ; D_{\alpha} \in V^{\prime \prime}\right\}$ with the distance function

$$
D\left(h_{\alpha}, h_{\beta}\right)=\max _{t \in E \cup v} \rho\left(h_{\alpha}(t), h_{\beta}(t)\right)
$$

is a metric space. In [3] (Theorem 2) Borsuk shows that this metric space is separable. It follows that there exists an element $D_{\alpha_{0}}$ of $V^{\prime \prime}$ such that if $\delta$ is a positive number then $\left\{h_{\beta} ; D\left(h_{\beta}, h_{\alpha}\right)<\delta\right\}$ is uncountable. Let $h_{\alpha_{0}}$ be denoted by $h_{0}, h_{0}(E)$ be denoted by $D_{0}$, and $h_{0}(v)$ be denoted by $a_{0}$.

Let the endpoints of $a_{0}$ be denoted by $x$ and $y$ and assume that the notation is chosen so that $y \in \operatorname{Int} D_{0}$. Let $z y x$ be an arc such that $a_{0} \subset z y x$ and $z y x$ pierces $D_{0}$ at $y$. Let $z w x$ be an arc in $E^{3}-D_{0}$ such that $z w x \cap z y x=\{z, x\}$, and let $J$ denote the simple closed curve $z y x \cup z w x$. Since $J \cup D_{0}=\{y\}$ it follows that $B d D_{0}$ links $J$.

Now let $\varepsilon_{1}$ be a positive number such that $2 \varepsilon_{1}$ is less than the minimum of $\varepsilon$, dist $\left(J, B d D_{0}\right)$, and dist $\left(z w x, D_{0}\right)$.

Let $H$ be $\left\{h_{\beta} ; D\left(h_{\beta}, h_{0}\right)<\varepsilon_{1} / 2\right\}$, and let $V^{\prime \prime \prime}$ be the set of all elements of $V^{\prime \prime}$ such that $D \in V^{\prime \prime \prime}$ if and only if there exists an element $h$ of $H$ such that $h(E)=D$. Now if $D_{1}$ and $D_{2}$ are two elements of $V^{\prime \prime \prime}$ then there exists a homeomorphism of $D_{1}$ onto $D_{2}$ that moves no point more than $\varepsilon_{1}$.

Suppose that $D$ is an element of $V^{\prime \prime \prime}$. Then since $2 \varepsilon_{1}<\operatorname{dist}\left(J, B d D_{0}\right)$, $B d D_{0}$ links $J$, and there is a homeomorphism of $D_{0}$ onto $D$ which moves no point more than $\varepsilon_{1} / 2$ it follows that $B d D$ links $J$, and hence that $J \cap D \neq \phi$. Since $2 \varepsilon_{1}<\operatorname{dist}\left(z w x, D_{0}\right), D \cap z y x \neq \phi$.

Now for each element $D_{\alpha}$ of $V^{\prime \prime \prime}$ let $P_{\alpha}$ be the greatest point of $D_{\alpha} \cap z y x$ in the order from $z$ to $x$ on $z y x$. Now there exists an element $D_{\gamma}$ of $V^{\prime \prime \prime}$ such that for uncountably many elements $D_{a}$ of $V^{\prime \prime \prime}$, $P_{\alpha}$ is greater than $P_{\gamma}$. But since $2 \varepsilon_{1}<\operatorname{dist}\left(x, D_{0}\right), 2 \varepsilon_{1}<\operatorname{dist}\left(J, B d D_{0}\right)$, and for each element $D_{a}$ of $V^{\prime \prime \prime}$ there is a homeomorphism of $D_{0} \cup a_{0}$ onto $D_{\alpha} \cup a_{\infty}$ which moves no point more than $\varepsilon_{1} / 2$, it follows that $a_{\gamma}$ intersects every element $D_{a}$ of $V^{\prime \prime \prime}$ such that $P_{\alpha}$ is greater than $P_{\gamma}$. This is because $a_{\gamma}$ may be completed to a simple closed curve $J^{\prime}$ which links $B d D_{\alpha}$ and which intersects $D_{a}$ only in $a_{\gamma}$. Hence $a_{\gamma}$ intersects uncountably many elements of the collection $V^{\prime \prime \prime}$. This is contradictory to the way in which $a_{\gamma}$ was chosen and it follows that the collection $V^{\prime}$ is countable. This establishes Lemma 1.

Lemma 2. Suppose that $V$ is an uncountable collection of mutu-
ally disjoint disks in $E^{3}$. Then there exists a disk $D$ of the collection $V$ such that $D$ is locally tame at each point of Int $D$.

Proof. Let $V$ be an uncountable collection of mutually disjoint disks in $E^{3}$. Let $V^{*}$ be an uncountable subcollection of $V$ satisfying the conclusion of Lemma 1. Let $D$ be an element of the collection $V^{*}$ and let $p$ be an interior point of $D$. By Theorem 5 of [1] there exists a subdisk $D^{\prime}$ of $D$ and a 2 -sphere $S$ in $E^{3}$ such that $p \in \operatorname{Int} D^{\prime}$ and $D^{\prime} \subset S$. Without loss of generality it may be assumed that $a p \subset \operatorname{Int} S$ and $p b \subset \operatorname{Ext} S$. Now there exist sequences $D_{1} D_{2} \cdots$ and $C_{1} C_{2} \cdots$ of disks of the collection $V^{*}$ such that for each $i$, (1) $D_{i} \cap a p \neq$ $\phi$, (2) $C_{i} \cap p b \neq \phi$, and (3) there exist homeomorphisms $f_{i}$ and $g_{i}$ of $D_{i}$ and $C_{i}$, respectively, onto $D$ which move no point more than $1 / i$.

Let $D^{\prime \prime}$ be a subdisk of $D^{\prime}$ such that $p \in \operatorname{Int} D^{\prime \prime}$ and $D^{\prime \prime} \subset \operatorname{Int} D^{\prime}$. Now without loss of generality it may be assumed that each of $f_{1}^{-1}\left(D^{\prime \prime}\right)$, $f_{2}^{-1}\left(D^{\prime \prime}\right) \cdots$ lies in Int $S$ and that each of $g_{1}^{-1}\left(D^{\prime \prime}\right), g_{2}^{-1}\left(D^{\prime \prime}\right) \cdots$ lies in Ext $S$. It follows from Theorem 9 of [1] that $S$ is locally tame at $p$ and hence that $D$ is locally tame at $p$. This establishes Lemma 2.

Lemma 3. If $D$ is a disk in $E^{3}$ and $D$ is locally tame at each point of Int $D$ then $D$ lies on a 2-sphere in $E^{3}$.

Proof. Let $D$ be a disk in $E^{3}$ which is locally tame at each point of Int $D$. It follows from [5] that there exists a homeomorphism $h$ of $E^{3}$ onto itself such that $h(D)$ is locally polyhedral except on $h(B d D)$. It follows from the proof of Lemma 5.1 of [4] that there exists a 2sphere $S$ in $E^{3}$ such that $h(D) \subset S$. Then $h^{-1}(S)$ is a 2 -sphere in $E^{3}$ such that $D \subset h^{-1}(S)$. This establishes Lemma 3.

## References

1. R. H. Bing, A surface is tame if its complement is 1-ULC, Trans. Amer. Math. Soc., 101 (1961), 294-305.
2. -, Conditions under which a surface in $E^{3}$ is tame, Fund. Math., 47 (1959), 105-139.
3. K. Borsuk, Sur les rétracts, Fund. Math., 17. (1931), 152-170.
4. O. G. Harrold, H. C. Griffeth and E. E. Posey, A characterization of tame curves in three space, Trans. Amer. Math. Soc., 79 (1955), 12-34.
5. E. E. Moise, Affine structures in 3-manifolds, IV. Piecewise linear approximations of homeomorphisms, Ann. of Math., 55 (1952), 215-222.
6. J. R. Stallings, Uncountably many wild disks, Ann. of Math., 71 (1960), 185-186.

The Institute for Advanced Study


[^0]:    Received January 15, 1963. This paper was witten while the author was a postdoctoral fellow of The National Science Foundation.

