This leads to an estimate of  $f(y|\mathbf{x})$  having the form

(1) 
$$\hat{f}(y|\mathbf{x}) = \exp\left(\sum_{k}\sum_{j}\hat{\beta}_{jk}H_{jk}(\mathbf{x})B_{k}(y) - c(\mathbf{h}(\mathbf{x};\hat{\boldsymbol{\beta}}))\right), \quad y \in \mathcal{Y},$$

where  $\hat{\beta}$  is the *JK*-tuple consisting of  $\hat{\beta}_{jk}$ ,  $1 \leq k \leq K$  and  $1 \leq j \leq J_k$ , in some order. This estimate has the form of a multiparameter exponential family, so the corresponding log-likelihood function is again concave. The asymptotic theory of such estimates, with  $\mathscr U$  a compact interval in  $\mathbb R$ ,  $\mathscr H_1 = \cdots = \mathscr H_K$  and bases consisting of B-splines and without model selection, has been treated in Stone (1989). It remains to investigate the numerical behavior of such estimates, especially as modified to incorporate the strategy of MARS. Perhaps the resulting technology should be referred to as multivariate adaptive response splines (MARES).

Suppose, in particular, that  $\mathscr{Y} = \{0,1\}$ . Then we can let  $\mathscr{S}$  be the one-dimensional space having basis  $B_1(y) = y$ . In this context, (1) reduces to logistic regression. Similarly, by letting  $\mathscr{Y}$  be a finite set of size 3 or more, we can apply the strategy of MARS to the polytomous extension of logistic regression.

The more general setup given by (1) allows for the estimation of the conditional variance and conditional quantiles of an arbitrary random variable Y given X as well as estimation of the conditional mean of Y given X, which is treated in the present paper.

The general strategy of MARS is also applicable to time series.

## REFERENCES

KOOPERBERG, C. and STONE, C. J. (1990). A study of logspline density estimation. *Comput. Statist. Data Anal.* To appear.

Stone, C. J. (1989). Asymptotics for doubly-flexible logspline response models. *Ann. Statist.* To appear.

Stone, C. J. (1990). Large-sample inference for log-spline models. Ann. Statist. 18 717-741.

DEPARTMENT OF STATISTICS UNIVERSITY OF CALIFORNIA BERKELEY, CALIFORNIA 94720

## CHONG Gu<sup>1</sup> AND GRACE WAHBA<sup>2</sup>

Purdue University and University of Wisconsin-Madison

We would like to begin by thanking Professor Friedman for a very interesting and thought-provoking paper. The idea of combining splines with recursive

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup>Research supported by National Sciences and Engineering Council of Canada while the author was at the University of British Columbia.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup>Research supported in part by Air Force Office of Scientific Research Grant AFOSR 90-0103 and in part by NSF Grant DMS-90-02566.